



Ex-post Evaluation 2012 – Brief Report

Sector Programme „Children and Youth as Target Group for Development Cooperation“

Published by:

Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit

Postfach 5180

65726 Eschborn

T +49 61 96 79-1408

F +49 61 96 79-801408

E evaluierung@giz.de

Internet:

www.giz.de

Published on behalf of the Federal Ministry for
Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)

Produced by:

Rolf Speit

Udo Gergaut

For:

AFC Consultants International GmbH/GOPA Consultants GmbH

This report was produced by independent external experts.
It reflects only their opinion and assessment.

Eschborn, March 2013

Tabular Overview

The evaluation mission

Evaluation period	August 2012 – March 2013
Evaluating consulting firm	AFC Consultants International GmbH/GOPA Consultants GmbH
Evaluation team	Rolf Speit (Team leader) Udo Gergaut (Assistant)

The development measure

Title according to the offer	Supra-regional sector programme “ Children and Youth as Target Group for Development Cooperation (DC)”
Number	1996.2163.2 (1st and 2nd phase) and 2003.2089.5 (3rd and 4th phase)
Overall term broken down by phases	1st phase: 01/1997-12/1999; 2nd phase: 01/2000-07/2003; 3rd phase: 8/2003-07/2006; 4th phase: 08/2006-03/2008.
Total costs	German contribution EUR 3.58 million (1st and 2nd phase altogether EUR 1.755 million, 3rd and 4th phase altogether EUR 1.825 million). Partner contributions: Personnel, office space, financing of workshops and conferences.
Overall objective as per the offer	Selected approaches for the promotion of children and youth as target groups for development cooperation and for strengthening the potentials of young people for poverty reduction are sustainably integrated in German and international development cooperation measures as well as in poverty reduction strategies.
Lead executing agency	Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)
Implementing organisations (in the partner country)	Not applicable (supra-regional programme)
Other participating development organisations	KfW, UNICEF, WHO, World Bank, Terre des Hommes, Kindernothilfe, CARE Germany, International Council of National Youth Policy (ICNYP), etc.
Target groups as per the offer	Children, adolescents and young adults up to an age of 24 years

The rating

<p>Overall rating</p> <p><i>On a scale of 1 (very good, significantly better than expected) to 6 (the project/program is useless, or the situation has deteriorated on balance)</i></p>	<p>2</p>
<p>Individual rating</p>	<p>Relevance: 2; Effectiveness: 2; Impact: 3; Efficiency: 3; Sustainability: 2</p>

Summary

The object of the independent ex-post evaluation was the **Sector Programme (SP) “Children and Youth as Target Groups for Development Cooperation”** financed by the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) and implemented by the German Technical Cooperation (GTZ, since 2011 GIZ). The evaluation was carried out by Rolf Speit (team leader) and Udo Gergaut (assistant) assigned by AFC Consultants International GmbH/GOPA Consultants GmbH from June 2012 to February 2013 on behalf of the GIZ Monitoring & Evaluation Unit. As the SP was based in Germany, no field missions were carried out. For the identification and analysis of information, a mix of various data sources and qualitative methods was chosen, including the assessment of documents recorded by the SP, the realization of interviews with SP resource persons, the analysis of pilot measures implemented by the SP, a comparative portfolio analysis of recent GTZ programmes, and a comparison group analysis.

In 2000, children and youth comprised 48% of the world population. In the same year, their share was 62% among the African population and 52% in Latin America. As young people find themselves in a period of transition whilst growing up, they are easily impressionable in both positive and negative senses and may become victims of social marginalization and economic exploitation. Over the last decades, the international community has been progressively engaged in child and youth promotion. The United Nations (UN) Convention on the Rights of the Child, adopted in 1990, was signed by 193 member states who committed themselves to respect and to protect the rights of children. In addition, a number of Millennium Development Goals (MDG), adopted in 2000, target children and youth. For a long time, however, this topic has only played a secondary role within the work of the German Development Cooperation. Thus it is only since the mid-1990s, that BMZ has begun to pay more attention to this particular topic.

Within GIZ/GTZ, sector programmes in general serve the purpose of providing BMZ demand-oriented advisory services for specific development cooperation topics. The Ministry used SP for the preparation and development of new policy themes. The SP in reference started in January 1997 and was implemented over a period of four phases until March 2008. Hence, the total duration covered a period of approximately eleven years. The target group comprised children, adolescents and young people up to an age of 24. The intermediaries included German public development cooperation organisations, multilateral organisations, as well as German and international non-governmental organisations (NGO).

The strategy document “Youth promotion and overcoming child labour”, published by BMZ in 1997, served as the basis to define the **concept** of the SP. It raised awareness on the need to consider youth as a proper target group and to develop new approaches for child and youth promotion. Against this background, the SP aimed at achieving the following **outcome (overall objective)**: *“Selected approaches for the promotion of children and youth as target groups for development cooperation and for strengthening the potentials of young people for poverty reduction are sustainably integrated in German and international development cooperation measures as well as in poverty reduction strategies”*. Thereby, the SP should contribute to perceive young women and men more distinctly as important stakeholders in political and social decision-making processes, including poverty reduction measures, and to consider their specific interests for public social and health policies (**impact - indirect results**). The share of young women and men affected by poverty, violence, and lack of rights should be reduced and their active participation in political and social decision-making processes should increase (**impact - highly aggregated results**).

The measures in order to achieve these objectives can be grouped into **four intervention areas**: Intervention area 1 aimed at preparing sector-specific and cross-cutting approaches for child and youth promotion. Intervention area 2 targeted the implementation of pilot measures for child and youth promotion in various partner countries. In doing so, the SP intended to obtain lessons learned that may serve as best practices. Intervention area 3 pursued the dissemination of prepared and partially tested approaches by means of various instruments, such as seminars, trainings, manuals and advisory services. The addressees included stakeholders from German and international development cooperation, NGOs and relevant local partner organisations. Intervention area 4 targeted as well the dissemination of promising approaches, this time, however, thematically focused on youth policy advice and on poverty reduction.

The SP concept was structured in a logical way and corresponded largely to the GIZ vision of “sustainable development”. The approach to position the topic of child and youth promotion both as an important cross-cutting issue and as a specific theme for development cooperation proved to make sense. Furthermore, it was reasonable to align the implementation from the third phase onwards more decisively towards the impact of poverty on children and youth, and towards the capacities of youth to contribute to poverty reduction. However, the original concept followed the results-based model only to a limited degree. Results-based indicators were defined in a significant way only from the third phase onwards. The impact was

monitored only at the level of pilot measures and did not include the impact that intermediates achieved by making use of the SP approaches.

For the **implementation** of the concept, one of the most important measures was the publication of 61 documents regarding sector-specific and cross-cutting instruments and methods for child and youth promotion (intervention 1). Since 2000, the SP has implemented a total of 12 pilot measures in 9 countries (Argentina, Bolivia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Burkina Faso, Cambodia, Cameroon, Chad, Chile, Rwanda; intervention 2). These measures covered the areas of reproductive health, dissemination of child and youth rights, vocational education, and political and social participation of youth. Measures for the dissemination and institutional anchoring of approaches for child and youth promotion (intervention 3) included, among others, participation in 17 national and international conferences and workshops, exchange with various GTZ departments and projects, trainings, and cooperation with the World Bank over several years. Several publications dealt with topics of youth policy and poverty reduction (intervention 4). The pilot measure in Cameroon supported the participation of youth in the preparation of a Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) at national level. The implementation was completely in line with the SP concept and mostly as well with international best practices. However, it would have been desirable to apply a more traceable approach in the selection of topics and pilot measures.

In manifold ways, the SP contributed to the **development of partner capacities**. On the individual level, capacity development via advice, information and training was delivered to a range of staff members from bi- and multilateral development organisations and to NGOs. Capacity development on an organisational level to intermediary institutions was carried out by means of disseminating SP approaches and methods. Among the large number of topics the SP dealt with, youth participation and youth policy approaches reached the highest level of dissemination internationally. Capacity development on a social level via networking was temporarily achieved by initiating and by participating at various forums regarding child and youth promotion topics.

The evaluation of the programme is based on the OECD/DAC criteria. The five criteria relevance, effectiveness, impact, efficiency and sustainability are rated as follows:

Relevance: The SP objectives were totally consistent with the needs of the target group, with the MDG as well as with the state of discussions within international organisations. Initially, BMZ also attested a high relevance of the topic of youth promotion and overcoming of child labour. However, due to the process of defining sector priorities starting in 2000, other sec-

tors have been prioritized at the expense of child and youth promotion. Still, the **relevance** of the SP is rated as **good (level 2)**, no significant deficiencies).

Effectiveness: The SP contributed significantly to place the topic of youth promotion on the agenda of the German and partly also the international development cooperation. It also managed to disseminate approaches of youth promotion based on the experience realm of young people. Within the scope of the evaluation, the portfolio analysis demonstrated that almost 50% of all GTZ measures in three selected sectors starting their implementation between 2004 and 2008 were related to child and youth promotion. Representatives from BMZ were by and large satisfied with the performance of the SP. The majority of pilot measures attained their objectives. However, the support to the participation of young people in PRSP processes proved to be of only limited success. Overall, the **effectiveness** is rated as **good (level 2)**, no significant deficiencies).

Impact: 75% of the pilot measures implemented by the SP showed a positive impact, as defined by the SP results chain. 45% of the measures in the portfolio analysis related to child and youth promotion also generated positive impact. They increased employment opportunities of young people on the labour market, provided adolescents with safe reproductive and sexual health practices and granted them a higher share of participation in political and social decision-making processes. The pilot measures reached out at 8,000 children and young people as well as 250 persons acting as multipliers. The **impact** is assessed as **satisfactory (level 3)**, positive results predominate).

Efficiency: Compared with the available resources, the SP delivered a remarkable amount of services and attained significant impact. Within the German as well as the international donor community, the SP served successfully as a means for coordination, development and dissemination of instruments and methods in the field of child and youth promotion. However, its production and allocation efficiency would have been higher with a shorter duration, since the amount of services delivered during the last phase was rather limited. Therefore, the **efficiency** is rated as **satisfactory (level 3)**, positive results predominate).

Sustainability: The integration of child and youth promotion within the German Development Cooperation has proven to be sustainable. This can be demonstrated by the following facts: At the end of 2011, GIZ was still implementing 105 programmes related to child and youth promotion; the target group of children and youth is taken into consideration in new sector strategy documents as well as within the health sector; GIZ has defined various products for child and youth promotion; the number of vocational education measures increased; KfW has adopted the topic of youth violence prevention; and, since 2008, BMZ is financing a new SP

under the name of “implementation of child and youth rights”. The pilot measures altogether showed a satisfactory level of sustainability. Within GIZ, the organisational unit “youth and demographics” is recording increasing demand for its services. Altogether, the evaluators rate the **sustainability as good (level 2, no significant deficiencies)**.

With the SP’s relevance, effectiveness and sustainability rated as good and with its impact and efficiency rated as satisfactory, the overall rating of the SP is assessed as **good (level 2)**.

Based on the analysis, the evaluators come up with the following **recommendations**:

- The evaluators recommend that the BMZ takes into account the target group of children and youth consistently within all sector and country strategy papers.
- The evaluators recommend GIZ to guarantee sufficient staffing of sector programmes, as this was the case in the evaluated SP, which deployed an advisor directly to BMZ.
- It is recommended that GIZ’s organisational unit “youth and demographics” prepares an annotated bibliography for child and youth promotion in development cooperation and to publish it on the internet.
- It is recommended that GIZ’s organisational unit “youth and demographics” designs its service offer in a way that takes into account the perspectives of the various GIZ sectors in a stringent manner.
- The evaluators suggest that the GIZ’s organisational unit “youth and demographics” and the SP “implementation of child and youth rights” support the preparation of a summary publication on best practices for child and youth promotion in development cooperation.
- The evaluators suggest that future SP adopt a more strategic approach regarding the selection of pilot measures for testing innovative instruments and methods.
- For future SP which comprise a potentially large variety of themes, the evaluators recommend to apply the “funnel approach” in which a phase of a broadly based introduction is followed by a phase of implementing prioritized key topics.
- The SP results-based monitoring system had several shortcomings. Provided that this is not an isolated case, the evaluators recommend to the GIZ Monitoring & Evaluation Unit to prepare propositions for a consistent integration of results-based monitoring in all GIZ measures.

Target – performance comparison based on indicators modified during the inception phase of the independent evaluation (including the status of BMZ markers)

Sector Programme „Promotion of Children and Youth as Target Group for Development Cooperation“, supra-regional, PN: 1996.2163.2 and 2003.2089.5, Phases I-IV; Total duration 01/1997 to 03/2008				
Highly aggregated and indirect results (impact)	<i>Highly aggregated results:</i>			
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The share of young women and men affected by poverty, lawlessness and violence is reducing. • Young people are increasingly participating within political and social decision-making processes. • Young women and men are contributing in an equitable manner to political and social development processes. 			
BMZ marks: MSA, PD/GG 1, G 1 and UR 0.	<i>Indirect results:</i>			
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Young people are successfully supported in making use of their potential for poverty reduction. • Public social and health policy measures are increasingly considering the specific needs of children and of young women and men. • Public and non-state institutions increasingly perceive young women and men as important stakeholders of political and social decision-making processes. 			
Attribution Gap				
Direct results (outcome)	Selected approaches for the promotion of children and youth as target groups for development cooperation and for strengthening the potentials of young people for poverty reduction are sustainably integrated in German and international development cooperation measures as well as in poverty reduction strategies.			
Indicator 1: From 2004 onwards, at least 50% of newly implemented GTZ measures in the sectors of health, governance, and economic/employment promotion are considering the specific situation of girls and boys in their project planning and implementation (<i>slightly modified indicator from phase II</i>).	Indicator achieved			
Indicator 2: From 2006 onwards, at least three multi-lateral organisations (e.g. World Bank, UNICEF, UNESCO) and two NGOs or public bilateral development organisations verifiably incorporated at least two child and youth promotion approaches and lessons learnt resulting from the sector programme within their portfolio (<i>new indicator</i>).	Indicator achieved			
Indicator 3: Until 2008, in at least five countries the participation of young people at PRSP processes has increased as a result of measures introduced by the sector programme (<i>slightly modified indicator from phases III and IV</i>).	Indicator partly achieved			
	Intervention 1 Appraisal of sector-specific and cross-cutting approaches for child and youth promotion	Intervention 2 Support and appraisal of pilot measures in partner countries	Intervention 3 Dissemination and integration of child and youth promotion approaches in German Development Cooperation and within other donor organisations	Intervention 4 Dissemination and integration of approaches for youth policy advice and youth integration in poverty reduction strategies
Results at the level of inter-	The approaches have led to an in-depth comprehension of success fac-	Pilot measures have successfully tapped the potential of young people	Stakeholders of German Development Cooperation, multi-lateral organ-	Stakeholders of German Development Cooperation, multi-lateral organ-

Sector Programme „Promotion of Children and Youth as Target Group for Development Cooperation“, supra-regional, PN: 1996.2163.2 and 2003.2089.5, Phases I-IV; Total duration 01/1997 to 03/2008				
ventions (outcomes)	tors for child and youth promotion at the relevant stakeholders.	in various topics and have therefore contributed to an in-depth comprehension of success factors.	isations, German and international NGOs and institutions within partner countries comprehend the topic of child and youth promotion as an important cross-cutting issue and as a relevant topic for development cooperation.	isations, German and international NGOs and institutions within partner countries comprehend youth policy advice and the integration of children and youth in poverty reduction processes increasingly as a relevant field of action for development cooperation.
Indicator 1	In a survey of at least 20 staff members of German and international development cooperation organisations and of NGOs, more than 50% of them confirm that the exchange with the sector programme broadened their comprehension of success factors for child and youth promotion. <i>(new indicator)</i>	Assessments of all pilot measures confirm that children and youth have successfully been supported, as defined in their respective objectives, until the end of the programme duration. <i>(new indicator)</i>	Until the end of 2004, the topic of child and youth promotion has been highlighted as an important field of action during at least three events with participation of national and international organisations. <i>(modified indicator 4.2 from phase I)</i>	Until mid-2003, BMZ develops a strategy for implementing the resolutions from the World Summit for Children in 2002, based on experiences by the sector programme. <i>(slightly modified indicator from phases III and IV)</i>
	Indicator achieved	Indicator achieved	Indicator achieved	Indicator not achieved
Indicator 2		Assessments of all pilot measures confirm that the pilot measures have been sustainable and have produced multiplier effects. <i>(new indicator)</i>	For at least five areas (e.g. health, governance, economic and employment promotion, rural development, violence prevention), GTZ has prepared hand-outs for the topic of child and youth promotion. <i>(new indicator)</i>	Until the end of 2005, public organisations in at least five countries have developed and documented – inspired by the sector programme – approaches for the participation of young people at PRSP processes. <i>(new indicator)</i>
		Indicator partly achieved	Indicator achieved	Indicator partly achieved
Indicator 3			Till 12/19999, for each pilot country a country strategy paper on youth issues exists. <i>(slightly modified indicator from phase I)</i>	
			Indicator not achieved	

BILDUNG EDUCATION
ÉDUCATION
BILDUNG EDUCATION
EDUCATION EDUCACIÓN
BILDUNG ÉDUCATION EDUCATION

Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5
65760 Eschborn/Germany
T +49 61 96 79-1408
F +49 61 96 79-801408
E evaluierung@giz.de
I www.giz.de