



## Ex-post evaluation 2012 – Brief Report

Basic Education for Afghan Refugees (BEFARe), Pakistan

As a federally owned enterprise, we support the German Government in achieving its objectives in the field of international cooperation for sustainable development. This publication presents former GTZ/DED/InWEnt activities; due to the change of the company's name, these will be referred to in the following as GIZ activities. Items from named contributors do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher.

**Published by**

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

**Registered offices**

Bonn and Eschborn, Germany  
T +49 228 44 60-0 (Bonn)  
T +49 61 96 79-0 (Eschborn)  
Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 40

53113 Bonn, Germany  
T +49 228 44 60-0  
F +49 228 44 60-17 66

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5  
65760 Eschborn, Germany

T +49 61 96 79-0  
F +49 61 96 79-11 15  
E [info@giz.de](mailto:info@giz.de)  
I [www.giz.de](http://www.giz.de)

Produced by:  
Andreas Dernbach

For:  
GFA Consulting Group GmbH

This report was produced by independent experts.  
It reflects only their opinion and assessment.

Eschborn, May 2013

## Tabular overview

### The evaluation mission

Evaluation period	07/2012 - 04/2013
Evaluating institute / consulting firm	GFA Consulting Group GmbH, Germany
Evaluation team	Andreas Dernbach / Ahmad Jan and Bibi Maryam (in addition: Christian Wachsmuth, GFA seconded Young Professional)

### The development measure

Title according to the offer	Basic Education for Afghan Refugees, Pakistan
Number	1990.2043.9; 1998.2192.7; 2002.2269.5
Overall term broken down by phases	1.10.1990 – 31.12.1998; 01.01.1999 – 30.09.2002; 01.10.2002 – 27.06.2007
Total costs	EUR 6,266,255.25 (1990.2043.9) EUR 2,655,644.69 (1998.2192.7) EUR 1,313,836.99 (2002.2269.5) No partner contributions
Overall objective as per the offer, for ongoing development measures also the objective for the current phase	Basic education aimed at repatriation and independence is promoted and improved.
Lead executing agency	Ministry of States and Frontier Region
Implementing organisations (in the partner country)	Commissionerate for Afghan Refugees, Peshawar, Pakistan
Other participating development organisations	UNHCR, DFID, World Bank, CIDA

<p>Target groups as per the offer</p>	<p>Primary target groups: Afghan refugees from rural camps in KPK (boys and girls in formal basic education from grade 1 to 6, and men, women, boys and girls in non-formal basic education), members of refugee communities, and girls and working boys, youths and women from Pakistani communities in proximity to the refugee camps.</p> <p>Intermediaries: master trainers, field education supervisors, headmasters, teachers in formal education, and master trainers and literacy instructors in non-formal education, and head of departments of the NGO BEFARe and the members of school management committees.</p>
---------------------------------------	---

### The rating

<p>Overall rating</p> <p><i>On a scale of 1 (very good, significantly better than expected) to 6 (the project/program is useless, or the situation has deteriorated on balance)</i></p>	<p>The overall rating for the project is good, no significant defects (level 2)</p>
<p>Individual rating</p>	<p>Relevance: 2; Effectiveness: 2; Impact: 3; Efficiency: 2; Sustainability: 2</p>

## Executive Summary

The Project “Basic Education for Afghan Refugees, Pakistan” (BEFARe Project) was designed to address the lack of basic education for millions of Afghan refugees (children and adults) in Pakistan. The core problem identified was the very limited access to education which was believed to cause life-long disadvantages regarding employability or other forms of income generation, thus creating sustained poverty either in the host country Pakistan or in the home country Afghanistan.

The Project as implemented by German Technical Cooperation (GTZ, today called GIZ) under an agreement between the Government of Pakistan (GoP) and the Government of Germany from October 1990 until June 2007. This independent evaluation report covers Project phases 5 (01/1999 – 09/2002) and 6 (10/2002 – 06/2007). The Project’s lead executing agency was the Ministry of States and Frontier Region (SAFRON) in Pakistan and the Commissionerate for Afghan Refugees (CAR) in the city of Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province (KPK), Pakistan, was the implementing organisation.

Most of the Project funds were provided by third parties. The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) was the main donor to the Project and provided 86 percent of the total costs. The German contribution to the Project, which equalled less than ten percent of the overall Project expenditures, was EUR 2,655,645 (phase 5) and EUR 1,313,837 (phase 6). The partner country did not co-finance the Project.

The Project’s overall objective was: “Basic education aimed at repatriation and independence is promoted and improved”. The Project objectives in phase 5 and 6 were: “Basic education becomes more functional through the integration of vocational measures and the participation of communities so as to better meet the needs of the Afghan refugees, and in particular women and girls” and “The independent organisation that has emerged from BEFARe implements on a sustained and independent basis tasks in the field of basic education for Afghan refugees and for Pakistani target groups”, respectively.

The primary target groups of the Project included Afghan refugees from rural camps in KPK (boys and girls from grade 1 to 6, men and women), and members of Pakistani communities in proximity to the refugee camps. Project intermediaries (master trainers, field education supervisors, headmasters, teachers in basic formal education, and literacy instructors in non-formal education) received substantial training (secondary target groups).

The evaluation period lasted from 07/2012 until 04/2013 including the field mission in KPK (December 1 – 22, 2012). The evaluation team included the team leader (Mr. Andreas Dernbach), and one young professional seconded by GFA Consulting Group to the mission

(Mr. Christian Wachsmuth), one female Afghan evaluation expert (Ms. Maryam Bibi), who interviewed women and girls in the Afghan refugee camps, and Mr. Ahmad Jan who interviewed male refugees.

The applied evaluation methods included archive research and analysis of teaching and learning materials, as well as structured interviews with participants (target group) in non-formal basic education measures (adult literacy, mother-child-health and vocational orientation courses). In order to assess the impact of the Project, the evaluators interviewed refugees who had not participated in non-formal basic education courses (comparison group). The composition of both interviewees from target group and comparison group reflected the mixture of Project participants in terms of gender (approximately two third men and one third women). In addition, the evaluation team implemented structured observations of formal basic education lessons in schools managed by the Project successor organisation, the non-governmental organisation (NGO) BEFARe, and in private non-BEFARe schools. Additional information was researched through semi-structured interviews with key personnel of stakeholders, including CAR, UNHCR, and NGO BEFARe.

In summary, the results chain of the Project reads as follows: Afghan refugees in Pakistan have very limited capacities to generate their own income and therefore depend on external assistance. The development and provision of basic education in conjunction with vocational orientation measures and the mobilisation of refugee communities can improve the refugees' ability to improve their income and thus their livelihood. Through an improved access to and quality of education for school-age refugee children (especially girls) the necessary pre-conditions for continued education on secondary level (which is critical for sustainable employment and related income) are created. Non-formal basic education for adult refugees was provided by the Project in order to improve the perception of education among the target group and to increase their capacity to generate the necessary income for their livelihood.

This results chain, on the basis of which this evaluation was implemented, focuses on the maintenance of livelihood of target groups and omits the repatriation aspect, which was included in the original definition of the overriding Project objective. The evaluators regarded the definition of the original overriding objective as being problematic because 'basic education for repatriation' is not part of German development policy. The direct Project results for phases 5 (which was reconstructed) and 6 (which remains unchanged) now read "Access and quality of formal and non-formal basic education is improved for Afghan refugees in Pakistan and for Pakistani target groups (including women and girls)" and "The independent organisation that has emerged from BEFARe implements on a sustained and independent basis tasks in the field of basic education for Afghan refugees and Pakistani

target groups”, respectively. The original definition of the Project objective of phase 5 was partly assessed to be too vague (terms like ‘more functional’ and ‘to better meet the needs’ were regarded problematic) and therefore the evaluators proposed a reconstructed direct result for phase 5 as defined above.

Formal basic education was provided by the Project under a third-party agreement with UNHCR (“community-oriented primary education”, COPE) from 1996 onwards. It covered grades 1 to 6, two years less than recommended in the UNHCR’s *Education Field Guidelines* due to lack of international funding. It is estimated that on average 50 to 60 percent of Afghan school-age children have had access to formal primary education. Since a large part of the Afghan refugee community lives anonymously in Pakistan, more accurate figures are not available. The Project managed to increase the average percentage of female pupils which ranged between 22 percent in the year 1999 and 27 percent in the year 2005. Gender disaggregated figures for the years 2006 and 2007 were not available. The share of female pupils in primary BEFARe primary refugee schools went up to 31 percent in the year 2009 but then decreased again to 24 percent in the year 2012. The phased planning and design of the Project and the insecure funding from UNHCR made it difficult for the project management to plan on a long-term basis.

The number of teachers reached the maximum level in the year 2003 (nearly 2,900) and then was downsized to 1,200 by the end of the Project. In 2012, the NGO BEFARe employed 952 teachers. In the period 1999 – 2003 the pupil-teacher-ratio went down from 46:1 to 39:1, and then went up to 72:1 in the year 2009 and last year stood again at lower levels (58:1).

The Project developed non-formal home schooling programmes reaching children who otherwise would not attend primary education. Home schools were held in the house of the teacher or of mothers; they had more flexible timetables and shorter durations which made it easier for girls in particular to gain access to basic education. With this type of teaching the syllabus and material normally covered in five school years were dealt with in a period of 30 months. The subjects were identical with those in formal basic education.

The Project provided basic training, refresher training and on-the-job pre-service and in-service training for some 7,000 teachers including 2,100 female teachers including training in general methodology, didactics and the use of pupil-oriented teaching/learning materials.

The Project developed, printed and distributed more than 135 teaching materials; mostly supplementary teaching materials and teachers’ guides, but also studies, research-oriented reports and books. The materials were shared with a large number of other donors and organisations in basic education for Afghan refugees in Pakistan and in Afghanistan.

The Project supported the establishment of community-based School Management Committees (SMCs) at each individual school and with each literacy measure, and provided training for SMC members. The work of the SMCs not only led to the decline in the drop-out rates, but also to a significant increase in the enrolment of girls. The SMCs also contributed to the financing of formal basic education through the collection of voluntary minor contributions from pupils' parents.

Non-formal basic education included teacher training and the production of materials: The following courses were conducted: (i) Mother-Child-Health (MCH), (ii) adult literacy (AL), (iii) home schools for girls and boys, and (iv) vocational orientation (VO). Since 1989 over 82,300 women participated in MCH courses and since 1992 more than 71,200 in AL courses. Only 310 trainees participated in non-formal VO courses which were discontinued in 2000 only a few months after their debut due to the lack of funding.

In phase 6 the Project focused on the establishment and development of a successor organisation, the NGO BEFARe, which was successfully registered in December 2003. The Project implemented capacity development with regard to quality management (leading to ISO 9001:2001 certifications at the end of the year 2006), financial management systems, monitoring & evaluation, and marketing and sales capacities. Furthermore the Project supported the start-up of the successor NGO through the payment of EUR 45,000 financing of salaries of the CEO and two additional senior managers for a period of nine months. Today, the NGO BEFARe receives up to USD 10 million mainly from UNHCR for the provision not only of basic education, but also of a number of other social services for Afghan refugees and for Pakistani target groups in refugee affected areas.

In this report, the evaluation results are presented along five standard criteria, including relevance, effectiveness, impact, efficiency, and sustainability.

Overall the Project is rated as **good, no significant defects (rating 2)**. This overall rating reflects that four out of five DAC criteria are rated good and one criteria being rated as satisfactory.

The Project's **relevance** is rated **good, no significant defects (rating 2)**. The Project was in line with needs of the partner country and the BMZ/GTZ basic education policy. The Project also met the needs of Afghan refugees and of the NGO BEFARe.

The Project's **effectiveness** is rated **good, no significant defects (rating 2)** taking into consideration its performance measured by all indicators defined under seven results in phase 5 and four results in phase 6.

The **impact** of the Project is rated **satisfactory; positive results predominate (rating 3)**. The Project succeeded in improving access to formal and non-formal basic education and to improve the quality of its education services aiming to strengthen community participation, to increase income generation and to ultimately improve the livelihood of the target group. While the preconditions for changes have been put in place, the design of non-formal education measures was partly not functional and not sufficiently market-oriented to achieve impact.

The Project's **efficiency** is rated **good, no significant defects (rating 2)**. Overall, the Project had a sound and frugal practice. The use of the broad range of newly developed teaching materials by the Project and other NGOs contributed to the efficiency of the Project. However, the Project's efficiency was adversely affected by the lack of predictability of funding and the lack of ownership of the GoP.

The **sustainability** of the Project is rated **good, no significant defects (rating 2)**. The NGO BEFARe increasingly provides technical assistance services for the international donor community, also beyond basic formal and non-formal education to Afghan refugees. Since its foundation in 2003, the NGO BEFARe has constantly grown and today also targets men and women from Pakistani communities in refugee affected areas. Furthermore the NGO provides support to Afghan refugees and Pakistani citizens suffering from damages caused by natural calamities.

**Recommendations** to BMZ/GIZ, SAFRON/CAR, UNHCR and the NGO BEFARe include:

- BMZ/GIZ: To pay more attention to capacity building within relevant host country government authorities in order to strengthen the latter's ability to perform their mandates while at the same time leading the international donor community.
- To integrate small business promotion into basic education programmes more prominently from the very beginning, and to seek more intensively the cooperation with other development partners in this respect.
- To make use of the existing know-how and capacities in terms of materials development and in-service training for basic education teachers and instructors available at the NGO BEFARe, for the design and implementation of basic education for refugee programmes in Pakistan, Afghanistan and beyond the two countries.
- SAFRON/CAR: To make use of capacity building opportunities and to take full responsibility for the provision of basic education for Afghan refugees.

- To ensure the universal participation of all children in the refugee villages/camps in Pakistan in basic education from grade 1 to 8 focusing on vulnerable groups and disabled children.
- UNHCR: To jointly participate together with the NGO BEFARe in the monitoring and evaluation of the basic education programme.
- To encourage competition among potential basic education service providers instead of exclusively contracting the NGO BEFARe.
- NGO BEFARe. To ensure minimum facilities' standards and to strengthen quality management.

**BEFARe Project Phase 5  
(1999 – 2002)**  
Indicators: Comparison of targets with actual situation as of reporting date

**Overall objective:**  
Afghan refugees and Pakistani target groups are enabled to maintain their livelihood in Pakistan or in Afghanistan (Afghan refugees after repatriation)

Cross-cutting issues				
Public Private Partnerships (PPP-0)	Poverty (EPA)	Good Governance (PD/GG-0)	Gender (G-1)	Environment (UR-0)
<b>STATUS:</b> not relevant	<b>STATUS:</b> Poverty is addressed by enabling target group to participate in non-formal income-generating oriented education.	<b>STATUS:</b> Project assumed temporary responsibility for the provision of basic education to Afghan refugees on behalf of SAFRON/CAR	<b>STATUS:</b> Project had strong gender focus and succeeded to increase absolute and relative enrolment of female learners in formal and non-formal basic education	<b>STATUS:</b> not relevant

**Phase 5 objective:**  
Newly trained teachers are able to arrange more effectively their lessons in primary education

**Overall Indicator Phase 5**  
60 percent of graduates from formal or non-formal education activities (at least 30% are female) who subsequently participate in a vocational orientation courses, are employed or self-employed and generate income.  
**STATUS:**

<b>Result 1, Indicator 1:</b> Complete set of Dari-language books for grades 1-6 are developed and made available until 12/2002 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 1, Indicator 2:</b> Pashtu-language and mathematics books for grades 1.3 are revised and made available until 12/2000 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 1, Indicator 3:</b> Teaching- and learning materials for at least 4 new topics are developed and/or integrated in already existing measures until 4/2000 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 1, Indicator 4:</b> At least eight consultations with NGO working group are implemented until 7/2002 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 1, Indicator 5:</b> Teaching and learning materials for 15 different vocational orientations are adapted and revised until 6/2001. <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 2, Indicator 1</b> Entire training personnel is trained in new topics/materials until 6/2001 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 2, Indicator 2</b> Entire field personnel is trained by training personnel in new topics/materials until 6/2001 <b>STATUS:</b>	

<b>Result 2, Indicator 3:</b> COPE is able to implement in-service training for external formal education staff and to carry out supervision and monitoring until 12/2002 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 3, Indicator 1</b> Revised time schedules for all courses are available until 3/1999 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 2, Indicator 4</b> At least two common training courses per year with similar projects/NGOs take place <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 3, Indicator 2</b> Training personnel is trained until 12/2000 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 3, Indicator 3</b> 4,000 men and 2,800 women have participated in literacy courses until 12/2002 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 3, Indicator 4</b> 5,000 children (of which 50% girls) have participated in „out-of-school“ courses, and 2,000 girls in „home-school“ courses until 12/2002 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 3, Indicator 5</b> All literacy course instructors have received refresher training until 12/2000 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 3, Indicator 6</b> 20 new mobile libraries have been equipped <b>STATUS:</b> Only 10 mobile libraries
<b>Result 4, Indicator 1</b> Framework conditions and implementation guidelines are formulated until 3/1999 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 4, Indicator 2</b> 3,000 formal and non-formal education graduates are trained in different vocat. orientations <b>STATUS:</b> Only 310 participants

<b>Result 4, Indicator 3</b> 30% of participants are women and girls <b>STATUS:</b> 20% female participants	<b>Result 5, Indicator 1</b> 274 SMCs are in-service trained in line with new approach until 6/2002 <b>STATUS:</b> 284 SMCs trained
<b>Result 5, Indicator 2</b> At least four common workshops with UNHCR, CAR/SWC and RBTU regarding Community Development implemented until 12/2002 <b>STATUS:</b> 4 workshops	<b>Result 5, Indicator 3</b> 70% of SMCs generate income from communities for maintenance and repair works, and for additional school activities <b>STATUS:</b> 93% of SMCs generate income
<b>Result 5, Indicator 4</b> By 6/2002: Net enrolment rate of first grader increased by 20% (girls and boys) and drop-out rate reduced by 25% against 1998 figure. <b>STATUS:</b> 10% to 17.5% increase; drop-out rate reduced by 10%	<b>Result 6, Indicator 1</b> At least seven key organisations successfully use BEFARe materials <b>STATUS:</b> 13 key organisations use materials
<b>Result 7, Indicator 1</b> Human resources development plan developed until 6/1999 <b>STATUS:</b>	<b>Result 7, Indicator 2</b> Project personnel in-service trained according to new requirements until 12/2000 <b>STATUS:</b>
<b>Result 7, Indicator 3</b> Six project proposals elaborated and forwarded to potential donors until 12/2002 <b>STATUS:</b> 12 proposals	<b>Result 7, Indicator 4</b> At least four contracts signed until 12/2000 <b>STATUS:</b> 5 contracts signed

**DATE: 06/2007**  
**Green:** Indicator achieved  
**Yellow:** Work ongoing  
**Red:** Not achieved/unlikely to be achieved  
**Blue:** Work not yet started/in preparation

**BEFARe Project Phase 6  
(2002 – 2007)**  
Indicators: Comparison of targets with actual situation as of reporting date

**Overall objective:**  
Afghan refugees and Pakistani target groups are enabled to maintain their livelihood in Pakistan or in Afghanistan (Afghan refugees after repatriation)

Cross-cutting issues				
Public Private Partnerships (PPP-0)	Poverty (EPA)	Good Governance (PD/GG-0)	Gender (G-1)	Environment (UR-0)
<b>STATUS:</b> not relevant	<b>STATUS:</b> Poverty is addressed by enabling target group to participated in non-formal income-generating oriented education.	<b>STATUS:</b> Project assumed temporary responsibility for the provision of basic education to Afghan refugees on behalf of SAFRON/CAR	<b>STATUS:</b> Project had strong gender focus and succeeded to increase absolute and relative enrolment of female learners in formal and non-formal basic education	<b>STATUS:</b> not relevant

**Phase 6 objective:**  
The independent organisation that has emerged from BEFARe [Project] implements on a sustained and independent basis tasks in the field of basic education for Afghan refugees and for Pakistani target groups.

**Overall Indicator Phase 6**  
Project is reorganised until the end of 2003 and thus able to continuously offer its know-how in qualified services and the Project BEFARe is furthermore contracted by international organisations/ donors to provide basic education services.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 1, Indicator 1:**  
The structure of the organisation is further developed and adapted according to the new general framework of independence (end of October 2004)  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 1, Indicator 2:**  
Adequate tools for the establishment of a comprehensive corporate validation system including best practices regarding knowledge-management are developed and centrally archived.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 1, Indicator 3:**  
Quality management documents are developed and options for ISO certification explored  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 1, Indicator 4:**  
Adapted accounting systems for international donor organisations are developed and implemented until mid-2004; basics in cost-benefit analysis as well as performance indicators are developed and analysed until the end of 2004.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 2, Indicator 1:**  
Contact, communication and meetings reg. new and expanded Government of Pakistan and US Government are regularly taking place.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 2, Indicator 2:**  
Additional new Project- and measure-proposals are developed and presented and are regularly discussed with interested investors  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 3, Indicator 1:**  
Existing teaching- and learning materials are revised under the new norm, Dari language materials (language and mathematics) are finalised up to grade 6 until March 2003  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 3, Indicator 2:**  
Successful experiences in teaching methods and learning techniques are available for other organisations.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 3, Indicator 3:**  
Master trainer, field education supervisors and teachers are trained according to newly developed training contents and methods.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 3, Indicator 4:**  
The initiated development of impact analysis of learning inputs (in-service training of teachers) and achievement of learning targets among pupils is finalized.  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 4, Indicator 1:**  
At least 100 literacy courses for men and women in Afghan refugee communities are implemented until end of 2003.  
**STATUS:** 100 courses (50% women and girls) ■

**Result 4, Indicator 2:**  
New community participation and participatory monitoring & evaluation approach successfully applied  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 4, Indicator 3:**  
Test and examination documents are developed and applied; tracer studies are available; tolls for the learning success and impact analysis are developed and technical staff is trained until 12/2004  
**STATUS:** ■

**Result 4, Indicator 4:**  
Probing and adoption of non-formal education teaching- and learning materials in Urdu-language available; missing materials are developed and in-service training of all non-formal education master trainers and field education supervisors is implemented.  
**STATUS:** ■

**DATE: 06/2007**  
Green: Indicator achieved  
Yellow: Work ongoing  
Red: Not achieved/unlikely to be achieved  
Blue: Work not yet started/in preparation

BILDUNG EDUCATION  
ÉDUCATION  
BILDUNG EDUCATION  
EDUCATION EDUCACIÓN  
BILDUNG ÉDUCATION EDUCATION

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 40  
53113 Bonn, Deutschland  
T +49 228 44 60-1877  
F +49 228 44 60-2877

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5  
65760 Eschborn, Deutschland  
T +49 61 96 79-14 08  
F +49 61 96 79-80 14 08

E [evaluierung@giz.de](mailto:evaluierung@giz.de)  
I [www.giz.de/monitoring](http://www.giz.de/monitoring)