Support to Good Governance in Pakistan

Enhancing effective, transparent and responsive governance at the national and provincial level
Constructive dialogue: a government official and citizens of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
**CONTENT**

**INTRODUCTION**
Support to Good Governance in Pakistan ........................................... 02

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT I**
Rules for Better Business Conduct ..................................................... 06

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT II**
Improved Training for Strong Local Government .............................. 08

**PREVENTION OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN I**
Hope After Years of Abuse ................................................................. 10

**PREVENTION OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN II**
Empowering Women ........................................................................... 12

**STATE-CITIZEN DIALOGUE**
From Anonymity to Game Changer ....................................................... 14

**OFFICIAL STATISTICS I**
Efficient, Rapid and Error-Free Data Processing .................................. 16

**OFFICIAL STATISTICS II**
Improved Communication, Better Results .......................................... 18

**TAXATION I**
Boosting Revenue by Developing Capacities ...................................... 20

**TAXATION II**
Managing Performance at the Federal Board of Revenue ................... 22
Support to Good Governance in Pakistan

Pakistan’s government faces significant challenges in ensuring good governance, including financial management. The 18th Amendment of Pakistan’s Constitution (2010) resulted in government functions being reassigned and more responsibilities being given to provincial levels — a shift reflecting government will to manifest more effective, transparent and responsive governance. However, poor public services, lack of transparency and tax equality remain major challenges. Combined with scant accountability, these challenges contribute to low levels of citizen trust in the state. Furthermore, large groups of the population, particularly women, are excluded from political, social and economic development.

As agreed during the regular German-Pakistani Inter-governmental Dialogues, the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH on behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) supports the Pakistan Government in the following areas:

- Local Government
- Taxation
- Prevention of Violence Against Women
- Official Statistics

In all of these areas, GIZ encourages a constructive state-citizen dialogue. Providing policy, technical, organisational and procedural advice, GIZ support stretches from the federal level to the provinces of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab, as well as to the semi-autonomous region of FATA.

Local Government

After 2013, local governments in the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa assumed new roles and responsibilities. The German Government’s objective here is to support the performance and accountability of selected local administrations and of the Local Government Department in the province.
Examples of achievements:

- In preparation for local government elections, GIZ supported the Local Government, Elections and Rural Development Department (LGE&RDD) and its Local Governance School to develop a training curriculum and manuals for 44,000 newly elected representatives. All major development partners are currently supporting the government to roll out the trainings based on the materials developed for the representatives to all districts.

- In order to implement the said constitutional amendment, GIZ supported the government in drafting Rules of Business for the new tehsil and village/neighbourhood councils. These rules are now regulating the work between government officials and elected representatives at different levels.

- With GIZ’s support, models for solid waste management and local revenue collection as well as participatory urban planning and budgeting were developed, thus improving the quality of municipal services and goods. Continued dialogue about these successful models has further improved local revenue and solid waste collection.

Examples of achievements:

- GIZ has fostered organisational development at the Federal Board of Revenue and promoted a more transparent, accountable, merit-based, learning organisation. It has generated job descriptions with performance indicators in order to improve the performance of senior staff.

- GIZ has implemented a number of activities improving the federal and provincial taxation authorities’ communication policies, procedures and practices for public relations and outreach.

- GIZ has assisted the provincial taxation authorities in training withholding agents, resulting in an increased collection of withheld sales taxes on services. Furthermore, support has been provided to the provincial authorities for internal learning processes, for amending taxation legislation and for establishing internal audit units.

Taxation

The low tax-to-GDP ratio of 8.5 per cent (2013) in Pakistan is a major problem in financing a sustainable budget. There is a lack of trust in public institutions and their handling of funds, resulting in the refusal to pay taxes. The German Government’s support aims at enhancing the federal and provincial governments’ performance in terms of revenue generation, transparency and accountability, thus enabling the financing of public services.
INTRODUCTION

Violence against women remains high in Pakistan. Female victims of violence still face many hurdles to access public services such as shelter, legal advice, medical assistance and psycho-social counselling. The German Government therefore assists Pakistan in increasing the capacity of government actors to prevent violence against women in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and FATA.

Examples of achievements:

- On average, 240 women and their children benefit monthly from improved management and service standards in women’s shelters in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Up-to-date data on public and private service providers ensured female victims of violence have better access to medical, psycho-social and legal advice.

- The Social Welfare Directorate of the FATA Secretariat developed the Women Empowerment and Protection Policy for FATA. The Directorate follows a standardised method to report to the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.

- Media is being sensitised about the causes and consequences of gender-based violence. Gender-sensitive reporting has been incorporated into the journalism studies programme at the University of Peshawar, where 40 journalists have been trained to date.

Prevention of Violence Against Women
Examples of achievements:

- The government has successfully completed the rebasing of price and trade indices as well as the compilation of Supply and Use Tables that will help it to improve national account estimation.
- Delays in data analysis have been reduced and the quality and comparability of price data improved by using tailor-made IT tools for data editing and analysis.
- The provincial statistics bureaus of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab launched a User Satisfaction Survey to get feedback on the quality of data and services provided to their public stakeholders.

The following stories feature a range of projects successfully carried out under GIZ’s Support to Good Governance programme in Pakistan between 2014 and 2016.
Rules for Better Business Conduct

Newly drafted rules enhance local governance of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province.

Having passed the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Local Government Act of 2013, it was decided that appropriate rules and bylaws were needed to help the three tiers of local government – district, tehsil and village/neighbourhood – to implement the Act. To this end, the Local Government, Elections and Rural Development Department (LGE&RDD) established an internal committee to oversee the process of compiling said rules. As no rules had been drafted in response to the 2012 Local Government Act (which also differed substantially in content from the Act of 2013), the committee drafted an entirely new set of rules to fulfil the requirements of the new Act.

GIZ provided support to the LGE&RDD in drafting the Rules of Business for the tehsil and the village/neighbourhood levels of local government. Furthermore, GIZ assisted in the development of the Rules for the Conduct of Business of the Local Government Commission.

Throughout the process, stakeholders thoroughly reviewed previous local and regional laws, acts and ordinances. As a result, in November 2015 the Chief Minister of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa approved the new rules – drafted in accordance with all clauses included in the Local Government Act of 2013.

Providing a set of protocols and procedures for both elected representatives and government functionaries at various levels of local government, the new rules help local government officials to deal with the daily tasks related to the conducting of business. Presented in a simple, standardised format, the document “Rules of Business” is easy to comprehend and helps users relate the rules to the corresponding clauses in the Act of 2013.
The new rules also provide both the public and private sector with information about the roles and responsibilities of the nazims (mayors), councils and government officers. In the interest of public transparency, the department has also made the rules freely available on its website:

http://lgkp.gov.pk/downloads/

The new rules help local governance in two other ways. Firstly, they form part of the training curriculum for newly elected representatives and employees of the department. In addition, they inform the work of development partners of the LGE&RDD of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (e.g. USAID, DFID, and UNDP), thus aiding international and regional cooperation with the province’s local governance system.
In May 2015, some 44,000 representatives were elected in the local elections of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. To equip them with a profound understanding of their roles and responsibilities under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Local Government Act of 2013 (Act of 2013), it was decided that a new training curriculum was needed. GIZ assisted the Local Government, Elections and Rural Development Department (LGE&RDD) both in developing and implementing this curriculum.

An initial report – conducted by GIZ in consultation with LGE&RDD – which outlined the scope, methodology, phases, and layout of training module content served as the basis of the new curriculum. This initial report also included broad policy principles to guide the training of trainers and the utilisation of the training module.

GIZ supported the development of a trainers’ manual in English and a participants’ manual in Urdu, both of which are fully aligned to the Act of 2013. The Urdu manual provides a common understanding of and unified terminology for the Act in a widely spoken regional language.
In collaboration with the Local Governance School in Peshawar, GIZ supported the LGE&RDD in conducting five trainings of trainers for 165 handpicked participants from across the province. Equipped with enhanced capacities and skills for implementing the Act of 2013, these regional trainers and another 25 master trainers can now impart their knowledge to elected representatives throughout the province.

For the first time, the LGE&RDD has a comprehensive training curriculum for building employee capacity with regard to the Act of 2013. This crucial tool will assist trainers working with elected representatives to clarify the latter’s roles and responsibilities. All major development partners active in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (e.g. the European Union, USAID, DFID, and UNDP) are currently using the material in a district-wide roll-out of trainings of elected representatives. GIZ has already supported such trainings in the districts of Haripur and Nowshera.

*Training of trainers: getting ready at a workshop in Peshawar to share knowledge with elected representatives throughout the province*
Eventually Sara heard about a women’s shelter in the city of Peshawar. There, she and her three daughters were taken in and provided with food, clothes and the necessary documentation. Sara’s daughters received basic education, while Sara was briefed on her rights and the rules and regulations of the shelter. The basis for all these procedures can be found in the Guidelines for Women’s Shelters for the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. These guidelines, published in 2012 by the province’s Social Welfare, Special Education and Women Empowerment Department, were developed with the support of GIZ.

Seeing that Sara was suffering the psychological effects of domestic violence, the women’s shelter found a psychologist for her; this was done using the shelter’s service directory, provided with the support of GIZ.

At the age of 14, Sara* was married to a man 20 years her senior. The local jirga – a forum of elders – had decided that Sara’s father was to settle a long-standing feud between two families by giving her in marriage to the other family. Her husband Khalid*, a 34-year-old man who was already married with children, never considered Sara as his proper wife. Sara’s new household members treated her as a servant. Also, her husband and other family members violated her rights in multiple ways: beating her and prohibiting her from visiting even her own mother.

After ten years of marriage, Sara was kicked out of the house, her husband arguing that her name was sullying his family’s reputation. She returned to her parent’s home begging for shelter, but they, too, rejected her.

Hope After Years of Abuse

In a women’s shelter, a young woman’s life is turned around.
Women’s shelters offer numerous other services for female victims of violence. When Sara decided to seek a divorce from her abusive husband, the women’s shelter referred her case to a local NGO, which provided her a female lawyer. Again, it was thanks to the shelter’s service directory that Sara was able to locate suitable legal counsel. Providing contacts for all service providers in the fields of legal and psychosocial counselling, health and economic skills, and women’s shelters, the directory is a vital link between female victims of violence and the services they most urgently require.

As part of her rehabilitation programme, Sara enrolled in a six-month basic tailoring course. Today, this young woman has an elementary qualification under her belt, is divorced, and working as a maid for a family. Together with her daughters, she lives in a small one-room house and is able to pay for her children’s education. After a long and painful journey, Sara is finally living a peaceful life and looking at a brighter future.

*The names were changed for reasons of confidentiality.*
Empowering Women

The first-ever policy to protect and empower women in the tribal areas

The Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) are a region in northwest Pakistan, divided into seven tribal agencies and six frontier regions. Decisions on day-to-day affairs are made in accordance with prevailing cultural norms. Traditions here encourage men – the main decision makers – to seek solutions to their common problems through consensus among the elders, in a forum called jirga. Meanwhile, women are mostly confined to their homes, are restricted in their mobility and have very little access to education and health services. As a result, most women have a very limited social life. Collectively these factors have prevented women from taking an active role in development.

The federal government’s FATA Secretariat manages the region’s administration. Since the Secretariat’s Social Welfare Department established the Women Empowerment Wing in 2010, it has been very active in addressing gender and women’s issues. A key issue is that family law and other laws related to women – both civil and criminal – have not been extended to the FATA region. Women in the region are thus excluded from the protection of these laws, and therefore lack access to justice. Steps need to be taken for women to enter mainstream society. A pillar of such an effort must be a policy for women’s protection.
In 2012, the Social Welfare Department took the initiative to draft a women’s protection policy in consultation with stakeholders from both government and non-government sectors. The initiative had two goals: 1) to bring about reform at the policy level, e.g. in the areas of women’s rights, including women’s empowerment and the prevention of violence against women; and 2) to improve the quality of service delivery at the implementation level.

The Social Welfare Department requested GIZ’s technical support in developing a women’s protection policy to be used both by government officers in the tribal agencies and frontier regions, as well as by non-governmental organisations. The media also needed to be brought on board to disseminate and communicate the women’s protection policy across the whole of FATA.

To achieve the goals of such a comprehensive policy, a thorough situation analysis was conducted. From women living at Jalozai camp (a refugee camp for Afghan refugees) to female students studying at Peshawar University, a broad range of women across FATA was consulted. In addition, all FATA government departments and many non-governmental organisations were included. GIZ provided assistance for the multiple rounds of consultations and in-depth discussions required, and additionally supported the Social Welfare Department in drafting and finalising the women’s protection policy.

The final draft of the policy was submitted to the Additional Chief Secretary FATA for approval and submission to the Governor of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and FATA, Sardar Mehtab Ahmed Khan.

Governor Mehtab approved the first-ever Women Empowerment and Protection Policy of FATA in July 2014, with the document officially launched in a ceremony held at the FATA Secretariat on 25 November 2014. GIZ subsequently supported translation and printing of the policy in Urdu and Pashto. GIZ also provided financial support to the Social Welfare Department to disseminate and prepare an implementation framework for the policy.
From Anonymity to Game Changer

Punjab Revenue Authority’s successful communications and outreach initiatives

At 8.5% of GDP (2013), Pakistan’s tax collection rate is one of the lowest worldwide. As part of a broader effort to increase the number of taxpayers, and following a constitutional amendment transferring certain fiscal responsibilities from the federal to the provincial level of government, the Punjab Revenue Authority (PRA) was established in 2012.

In Punjab province, the PRA was given the mandate to collect sales tax on services. However, the PRA has struggled to raise awareness of its mandate, failing to reach the public by use of traditional or social media. In short: PRA had no communications strategy.

In early 2015, GIZ organised a workshop on communications and media handling, which was attended by several PRA officers. The workshop highlighted the importance of reaching out to the public in the context of tax reforms. The PRA participants became increasingly aware of their agency’s lack of a communications strategy, and as a result, developed a draft input for such a strategy. They agreed that disseminating positive messages about the importance of the province’s development would be more fruitful than the conventional policing approach, which threatens taxpayers with punishment for non-compliance.

In follow-up meetings after the workshop, GIZ has continued to encourage PRA to steadily prioritise communications. GIZ also has encouraged the revenue authority to use social media platforms and to proactively reach out to mainstream media. All of this has brought about a fundamental change in PRA’s attitude towards taxpayer communication and citizen engagement.
Within its short lifetime, PRA has undergone a remarkable transformation in terms of raising awareness of its mandate, reaching out to taxpayers and establishing its image within the province. These achievements have not gone unnoticed. In 2015, PRA was listed as one of the 2015 Game Changers by Tribune Magazine, which emphasised the agency’s massive communications and outreach initiatives. Recently, the revenue authority was recognised as one of only two government departments in Punjab to have a website complying with the Right to Information Act.

PRA’s extensive media reach, both in print and on television, has substantially raised the agency’s visibility. PRA’s communications success has already inspired other tax agencies to step up their own efforts. One example is the Excise and Taxation Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, which is now actively engaged on social media.

The results of PRA’s change in approach are numerous:

- PRA has rebranded itself with a new logo and slogan, and developed a new website that complies with the Right to Information Act;
- PRA is now very active on social media;
- PRA regularly disseminates messages focusing on the potential for tax revenue to provide vital social services to taxpayers and citizens; and, finally,
- PRA has promoted female staff members, assigned them more tasks and brought them into the media spotlight, thus giving the agency a more accessible and professional image.

Within its short lifetime, PRA has undergone a remarkable transformation in terms of raising awareness of its mandate, reaching out to taxpayers and establishing its image within the province. These achievements have not gone unnoticed. In 2015, PRA was listed as one of the 2015 Game Changers by Tribune Magazine, which emphasised the agency’s massive communications and outreach initiatives. Recently, the revenue authority was recognised as one of only two government departments in Punjab to have a website complying with the Right to Information Act.

PRA’s extensive media reach, both in print and on television, has substantially raised the agency’s visibility. PRA’s communications success has already inspired other tax agencies to step up their own efforts. One example is the Excise and Taxation Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, which is now actively engaged on social media.
Efficient, Rapid and Error-Free Data Processing

A model solution: Pakistan successfully automated its price statistics process. Now, all eyes turn to trade statistics.

The Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) is a federal level organisation that collects, compiles, analyses, disseminates and publishes the nation’s statistical data. Its function extends to evaluating and introducing standard international concepts, definitions and classifications pertaining to statistical data series, such as consumer price index, wholesale price index, import indices, export indices and gross domestic product. The PBS also evaluates the efficiency of computation methods for statistics.

A key PBS service is the computing and publishing of price statistics on a weekly and monthly basis. Price statistics include consumer price indices, wholesale price indices, producer’s price indices and sensitive price indicators. These figures provide the measure of national inflation, and are used as deflators for various economic indicators.

It is essential that the process for determining these timely and extraordinarily sensitive economic indicators is efficient, rapid and error-free. The amount of data involved is typically large, and when computed manually, chances to make errors increase. The avoidance of errors is vital, given that, for example, the miscalculation of something like the annual wholesale price index can affect many other indicators of national accounts for which the index is a deflator. Thus a fully automated system is critical to minimising the possibility of errors.
The Price Section of PBS was previously based in Karachi, where it worked in collaboration with the Data Processing Centre. The Data Processing Centre provided hard copies of the data to the Price Section for editing, and up to ten rounds between the two were required to finalise the data. The software used to process data was command-driven, and computer programmes were written in an old programming language (Cobol) that is no longer popular. The staff familiar with Cobol was gradually retiring, and new staff was unfamiliar with this language. As a result, different programmers were writing different computer programmes for each type of index, meaning only certain programmers could run the programmes and non-standardised reports were being produced. The need to remove the Data Processing Centre from the process and limit manual interference was clear.

Therefore, the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics requested assistance in creating a fully automated Price Section. With GIZ’s technical support, this Price Section, complete with new customised software for data processing, has been established in the Statistics House, Islamabad. Having adopted the software, Price Section is running efficiently with limited staff, and is no longer dependent on programmers. Data coming from across Pakistan is edited onscreen, reducing the likelihood of error compared to paper-based editing. Prices for an item from shops all around Pakistan can be compared on one screen, and different colours highlight potential errors in the data. Errors can be corrected immediately. With complicated calculations just a click away, and reports promptly available in the required format, all section staff can run the software easily.

Every week, Price Section handles some 25 queries from various organisations, all of whom require price data and indices in different formats and with different specifications. Thanks to the new software, staff can now easily prepare day-to-day queries in response to the demands from different user groups.

With Pakistan’s price statistics completely modernised, the PBS now wants to develop similar software for external trade statistics. Preliminary work for this new venture has already been completed with GIZ’s cooperation.
Improved Communication, Better Results

Supporting two provincial bureaus of statistics in access to data, outreach and IT skills

Pakistan’s Provincial Bureaus of Statistics (PBoS) are responsible for compiling regional accounts. Ideally, regional accounts should be developed on the basis of national accounts. However, lack of cooperation between the federal and provincial levels in the area of accounting has made this challenging. Through in-depth discussions with representatives of the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics and the PBoS of Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, GIZ identified various areas for improving cooperation between them.

Public relations and communication were identified as key areas for improvement at the provincial level. Thus, as the first of several measures, GIZ assisted the two bureaus in organising events for World Statistics Day in October 2015.

GIZ also closely cooperates with the two bureaus in improving the quality of public services. To this end, in early 2016 GIZ supported PBoS Punjab in launching a User Satisfaction Survey to get feedback on the quality of data and services provided to the public.
PBoS Khyber Pakhtunkhwa launched a similar survey in February. In addition, GIZ assisted the bureau in developing a radio message to increase awareness in rural areas about another survey, called Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey, to ensure that the illiterate and those without a television are reached.

GIZ also developed an electronic version of the User Satisfaction Survey questionnaire for posting on both bureaus’ websites.

In autumn 2015, GIZ initiated an assessment of PBoS Punjab’s IT environment. Although the bureau’s hardware was satisfactory, its overall platform was found weak. Based on this, GIZ started building the bureau’s capacity by providing database system training to relevant bureau staff.

In late 2015, GIZ facilitated an advanced training in MS Excel at PBoS Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, helping the bureau’s statisticians to work more effectively and efficiently. GIZ has also developed software to help the bureau conduct a provincial agriculture input-output survey. This survey, to be carried out by the bureau’s regional accounts unit, will be the first of its kind.
Boosting Revenue by Developing Capacities

Public sector withholding agents in Punjab are now able to collect more tax revenue.

Tax revenue as a percentage of GDP (gross domestic product) is alarmingly low in Pakistan. In order to utilise tax bases to their full potential, tax authorities must be strengthened. GIZ is therefore assisting the Punjab Revenue Authority (PRA) to build capacity, so that it can effectively perform its core functions and expand its tax bases.

In late 2015, GIZ organised workshops for public sector withholding agents in Lahore, Gujranwala and Faisalabad. The purpose of the workshops was to train agents on their roles and responsibilities under the Punjab Sales Tax on Services Act, 2012. Participants were selected based on potential revenue impact, and collectively they represented over 80% of the public institutions that are required to withhold sales tax.

Conducted between October and December 2015, three successful workshops directly translated into revenue earned, as seen in the table to the right. While revenue collection figures were only 50% of the quarterly set target for the period of July to September 2015, the figures for the following quarter – after the workshops had taken place – have risen sharply.

| Quarterly Target: | 350.01 million |
| Revenue Collection Figures: |     |
| Quarter 1 (Jul – Sep) | 173.895 million |
| Quarter 2 (Oct – Dec) | 658.063 million |
| % of Quarterly Target Assigned | 188% |
| % increase from last Quarter | 378% |

Revenue figures (in Pakistani Rupee) refer to withheld taxes from public sector agents only.
The workshops garnered broad media interest, resulting in numerous newspaper articles and greatly enhancing the visibility and outreach of the Punjab Revenue Authority. News of the successful workshops spread to other provinces, and the Revenue Authority of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa now wants to hold a series of workshops for withholding agents in their province. As such, designated trainers will attend the next workshop in Punjab to discuss future trainings with the Punjab Revenue Authority and GIZ.

Meanwhile, in the province of Punjab, the development partners have agreed to offer workshops for the private sector in collaboration with the chambers of commerce.

Facts and figures show that this intervention not only is simple and effective, but also can be replicated as required. As seen from the latest initiative in Punjab, the workshops can be adapted to address private sector withholding agents, thus tapping into another significant revenue stream.

Two sides of the same coin: the businesses generate sales tax (bottom), the withholding tax agents (top) collect it for the public good.
Managing Performance at the Federal Board of Revenue

Broad organisational development leads to a new work culture.

Lacking key performance indicators that relate to job function, Pakistan’s Federal Board of Revenue (FBR) performance management system was unable to conduct effective and quantifiable employee performance appraisals at the field office level. Up-to-date job descriptions including current job functions, expectations of job roles and essential duties, and the competencies required to perform field office jobs were non-existent. There was also a lack of consistency and clarity concerning the roles, functions and tasks of FBR field officers, resulting in unclear job expectations and irrelevant performance appraisals.

In 2014, FBR requested support from GIZ to address these challenges. GIZ assisted FBR to develop clear job responsibilities with quantifiable key performance indicators for Inland Revenue service officers at FBR field offices (grades 17 to 21).

From January to April 2015, participatory workshops were carried out in the Karachi and Lahore field offices to gather inputs to develop job descriptions and key performance indicators. FBR can now measure employee performance against these established assessment tools; i.e. measurable outcomes tied to specific job tasks in field offices across the country.

Management can now conduct more effective job performance evaluations based on empirical evidence. This process produces a live document that can be tailored as needed and is freely accessible on the FBR website.

The development of job descriptions and key performance indicators has fostered organisational development at FBR, strengthening its capacity to engage in continuous competence development, innovation management, integration and appreciation of diversity ultimately nurturing a work culture conducive to learning. The result is a more transparent, accountable, merit-based and learning-ready organisation.

Additionally, GIZ’s support generated changes beyond the intervention’s anticipated scope.
FBR subsequently scaled up the process, using the same approach to develop job descriptions and key performance indicators for the Customs group. The Customs group document is also on the FBR website for easy access.

Following GIZ advice, the internal training provider (Directorate General of Training and Research or DGTR) assessed capacity needs to develop a qualification framework that accompanied the revised job descriptions and key performance indicators.

In the future, the DGTR will use this qualification framework in revising its in-house specialised training programme so that job requirements and training are closely and sustainably aligned.
Embracing change: the citizens of Pakistan are ready to engage with the state. GIZ’s Support to Good Governance Programme supports stakeholders in enhancing good governance.