



PROFESSIONAL
VOCATIONAL
FORMATION PROFESIONAL
BILDUNG

BERUFLICHE BILDUNG
MACIÓN PROFESIONAL
FORMATION PROFESSIONAL
BILDUNG
IONAL TRAINING

Ex-post evaluation 2010 – Brief Report

Promotion of the Takoradi Technical Institute, Ghana

Published by:

Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH
Evaluation Unit
Postfach 5180
65726 Eschborn
T +49 61 96 79-1408
F +49 61 96 79-801408
E evaluierung@giz.de

Prepared on behalf of:
Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development

Internet:
www.giz.de

Produced by:
FhochX GmbH und Health Focus GmbH

This report was produced by independent external experts.
It reflects only their opinion and assessment.

Potsdam, 07.03.2011

Tabular overview

The evaluation mission

Evaluation period	April - December/ 2010
Evaluating institute / consulting firm	FhochX - Institut für zukunftsfähiges Wirtschaften in Zusammenarbeit mit Health Focus
Evaluation team	Dr. Jörg Longmuß, international expert Mr. Alfred Kwasi Opoku, national expert Mr. Benjamin Ghartey, national project assistant

The development measure

Title according to the offer	Promotion of the Takoradi Technical Institute
Number	1996.2186.3 / 01.2160.8-001.00
Overall term broken down by phases	Previous project: Promotion of the construction (since 1977) and the piloting phase (launching of the vocational training in 1982) of the TTI by the GTZ from 1977 – 1990 Phase I: 7/1997 – 6/2001 Phase II: 7/2001-6/2005
Total costs	Planned overall cost according to the offer Phase I (1997 – 2001): 2.760.000,- € Phase II (2001-2005): 2.810.000,- € Planned cost of the GTZ (value of the contract) Phase I (1997 – 2001) ca. 1.630.000 € Phase II (2001-2005): ca. 1.673.000 € The actual overall expenses of the GTZ amounted to approximately 3.150.000,- €
Overall objective for phase II	The trainees of TTI acquire vocational skills and qualifications which correspond to the changing demands of the labour market
Lead executing agency	Ministry of Education
Implementing organisations (in the partner country)	Takoradi Technical Institute

Other participating development organisations	DED (German Development Service)
Target groups as per the offer	Young adolescence from the Western Region, especially females, who are mainly graduates from the secondary school system. Male and female employees and entrepreneurs from the formal as well as informal sector of the Western Region, who get further vocational qualifications.

The rating

<p>Overall rating</p> <p><i>On a scale of 1 (very good, significantly better than expected) to 6 (the project/program is useless, or the situation has deteriorated on balance)</i></p>	not satisfactory (level 4)
Individual rating	Relevance: satisfactory (level 3); Effectiveness: good (level 2); Impact: satisfactory (level 3); Efficiency: good (level 2); Sustainability: not satisfactory (level 4)

The Takoradi Technical Institute (TTI), which was established from 1978 to 1982 with co-financing from GTZ, is a vocational training centre for skilled workers in technical occupations. It is located in the port town of Takoradi/Sekondi (300 000 residents) in the Western Region of Ghana. Under the responsibility of the Education Ministry, it currently teaches some 1000 day-students for full-time courses lasting four years, as well as some 1500 part-time trainees taking evening classes. The final certificate is intended to be a qualification for a vocation and also entitles the holder to go on to an advanced educational institution.

According to the project offer of GTZ to the German Federal Ministry of International Cooperation (BMZ) in 1996, there had been a decline in performance standards since the end of the 1980s, with falling enrolments, rising dropout rates and a lower acceptance of the graduates by companies. The impact of TTI on the labour market and its image were therefore not up to expectations and too many of the graduates were without employment.

In the mid-1990s, an initiative came from the Ghanaian side and after a preliminary evaluation commissioned by GTZ a new period of cooperation followed with the project "Support for TTI" from 1997 to 2005. This project is the subject of this ex-post evaluation.

At first, from 1997 to 2001 there was an initial project phase with the objective: "Management abilities of TTI to adapt training to the needs of the private business sector are strengthened" and the prime objective: "Appropriately trained skilled workers are available for the labour market in sufficient quantities". A differentiated training programme with further training for members of the workforce, close cooperation with the regional economy and the marketing of services are intended to make TTI more effective, and at the same time to make it possible to generate a substantial proportion of the training costs.

The examination of the project was followed from June 2001 by a further four-year phase with the revised and extended objective: "The trainees of TTI acquire vocational skills and qualifications which correspond to the changing demands of the labour market" and the prime objective: "Improved, labour-market relevant technical and vocational skills and increased possibilities for creating income are available". The project was concluded in 2005 after the second promotional phase.

A consultant was appointed for the project management and various experts also contributed for short periods. With the support of the consultant, above all

- the management was renewed and strengthened, including the encouragement of external orders and performances (short occupational development courses, and services by the workshops) for the financing of maintenance measures, further by the implementation of maintenance measures, the introduction of effective bookkeeping, and by the introduction and implementation of a maintenance plan,
- measures were implemented to increase the proportion of women
- a supervisory board was set up with business representatives.

The overall planned costs for both phases equate to approx. EUR 5 570 000, including the contributions of the German Development Service (DED) and the Ghanaian government. The costs of GTZ totalled approx. EUR 3 150 000.

In the course of a BMZ-funded independent evaluation programme of GTZ, this project was subjected to an independent ex-post evaluation five years after its termination, carried out from April to December 2010 by the German consortium FhochX – *Institut für zukunftsfähiges Wirtschaften / Health Focus* (Project leader Dr. Jörg Longmuss) in cooperation with a national team of evaluators from JEA VCO Associates (Alfred Opoku and Benjamin Gharthey). The evaluation took place on the basis of the five criteria of the Development Assistance Committees of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD): relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability.

Relevance: The project was in agreement with the policies of the German Federal Ministry of International Cooperation (BMZ) and of the partner country. In principle, offering training courses which at least result in graduates having a no more than average risk of unemployment is suitable as a measure for combating poverty. The intended increase in the participation of women also corresponds to the basic objectives of Germany's development policies. A critical aspect of the project is that only one of the 26 technical institutes in Ghana was promoted. When the project was launched such individual promotion was no longer usual due to the limited scope – the focus had meanwhile shifted onto vocational training as a whole at the national level. It was not possible to determine the exact reason for the targeting of a single institution. In addition, the interested parties at national and regional levels (companies, associations, public authorities) were not integrated in the project as partners. Overall, the relevance was **satisfactory (Level 3)**.

Effectiveness: Of the 10 indicators which the project had defined for its success, six were fulfilled, two were partially fulfilled, and two were not fulfilled. Among other things, there was an effective financial controlling system, numerous external services, a considerable increase in the proportion of women, cooperation with many companies, and nationwide meetings with other Technical Institutes to share good practice, and a plan was drawn up for servicing and maintenance. The points which were not implemented (special short courses for external women, formal body with business representatives to assess the contents of the training courses) are therefore less significant. The overall effectiveness was rated **good (Level 2)**.

Impact: Of 57 surveyed graduates from 2008 (more could not be contacted within the limited scope of the evaluation) approx. 19 % were unemployed when surveyed in autumn 2010. This corresponds to the national average for urban areas (Ghana Survey 2000). 84 % of the interviewees said that the training at TTI had been a “very good” or “good” help for finding work. The training was an important reason why the graduates found employment after completing training.

In the company survey of the main employers of TTI graduates in recent years (as far as they could be contacted, mainly from the wood industry) the training at TTI was on average rated as “good”. At the same time, nine out of eleven companies said that the shortage of trained workers was a big problem. The available data cannot confirm that TTI would eliminate qualification problems in the Western Region as a general developmental constraint. In conclusion, the impact is assessed as **satisfactory (Level 3)**.

Efficiency: In many respects the efficiency is extremely good – having accepted that the remit was directed towards only a single institution. The structure was appropriate for the specified objective: one long-term specialist at hand over the duration of the project, plus other short-term specialists for additional input and support at important points, and in addition possibilities for the financing of equipment and teaching materials. This is balanced and fit for purpose. A main critical aspect is that there was no sign of cooperation with other development organisations or other initiatives in the field of vocational education which might possibly have increased the benefits from the invested funds. The regional limitation must also be taken into consideration. Therefore the efficiency was rated **good (Level 2)**.

Sustainability: A positive aspect is that TTI currently has approx. 10% women in its full-time technical training. This is much higher than at the start of the project (1 %) and higher than neighbouring institutes which do not exceed 5 %.

In order to understand the local conditions, it is important to be aware of a main problem faced by all technical institutes. Operating funds provided by the government for materials, maintenance, repairs and spare parts for machines and tools are only approx. EUR 2.50 per full-time student per annum. This is completely inadequate. Similarly, new acquisitions are rarely possible and are insufficient. In order to be able to use the equipment in the long term, a technical institute must therefore be able to generate significant additional funds.

In this and other respects, the capability of TTI five years after the end of the contribution of the GTZ consultant is far behind the status in 2005. For three key aspects of the project, by means of which the effective management of TTI and a high quality of training was to be ensured, activities have come to a complete stop in recent years:

- Since 2007 there have been no more meetings with industrial partners which could have ensured practical, demand-oriented training. The other coordination work with manufacturing companies has also broken down.
- After 2007, virtually no further training of external trainees has been carried out, and nor have any orders to completed for customers in the workshops. This means that there are no more additional funds available in order to back up the completely inadequate state payments for maintenance and repairs.
- There is not even an implemented maintenance plan for the workshops and the machines on the basis of the available funds.

The state of the machines and facilities is correspondingly poor. For example, the first visit of the evaluation team in September found only two out of seven lathes in working condition, four out of eight drilling machines, five out of eight arc welding machines, and one of the two lifting platforms. There was no plan for repairing the inoperable machines, or for acquiring spare parts.

To make matters worse, up to 50 people are now being trained in the workshops at times, although these were designed for groups of 25 trainees. An explanation for this lies in the policy of the Government of Ghana of offering training places to all those who are interested, even if the quality suffers as a result. This means that practical training is almost impossible. The inadequacy of hands-on training is

shown in the survey of graduates, in which by far the most frequent response to the open question for comments and proposals (from 50 % of respondents, multiple answers possible) was: “Improve the practical aspects of the training.”

The project can be credited with training some management personnel who have since left TTI and have introduced their acquired skills and qualifications in other structures. However, in order to justify the input into the project, the establishment of stable management structures including fostering junior management, and knowledge management should all have been more extensive and more effective.

It was not possible to reach any definite conclusions within the scope of this evaluation regarding a “lighthouse” function of TTI for other technical institutes and technical vocational training in Ghana. For the above-mentioned reasons, the sustainability is rated “**not satisfactory**” (**Level 4**).

In summary, the evaluation shows a Technical Institute forced to operate under very burdensome conditions, but where the graduates and the companies were in general satisfied with the direct results, despite the complaints about inadequate practical training. In addition, over the longer term a significant proportion of women has been established in the technical training courses. However, much more is to be expected in terms of sustainability from a project which involved considerable levels of funding for a single institute over eight years (e.g. concerning commercial contacts, income-generating measures, maintenance).

According to GIZ rules, a project is given an **overall assessment** of “**not satisfactory**” (**4**) if the sustainability is not satisfactory.

Recommendations to GIZ / BMZ are:

1. To make sure that all stakeholders are integrated in a project from the start, where possible as project partners,
2. A project of this sort should not be stopped abruptly with withdrawal of advisers, stoppage of all payments, etc.; a “Phasing Out” period should be provided, e.g. with occasional coaching in leadership and management as well as follow-up training for new personnel,
3. For vocational training projects in a comparable context, care should be taken to integrate the formal and the informal sector more, in order to use these businesses for practical training and to prepare trainees at TIs better for the whole breadth of the labour market,

4. Focus more on establishing stable management structures at the partner including extensive fostering of young managers and effective knowledge management as part of Capacity Development – including after the end of the project,
5. In general, projects should only be started when the structures which are to be established in the long term can be financed adequately from national funds on a permanent basis – or otherwise take the conscious decision to subsidise the corresponding sector for the foreseeable future.

Recommendations to the TTI:

6. Systematic maintenance plans should be established with clear priorities, which tasks to be executed and which spare parts to be procured first.
7. External services and short term courses should be resumes to generate additional funding for maintenance, repair and replacement of equipment.
8. Links to potential employers from bigger as well as from smaller companies and from the informal sector should be renewed.

Recommendations to COTVET and the Ministry of Education:

9. An appropriate funding of maintenance, repair and replacement of equipment and consumables has to be secured.
10. Vocational training institutions should no longer be distributed among different ministries, but attached to one single institution (e.g. COTVET) to support and promote them.
11. Ground-breaking concepts successfully developed and documented by the project (e.g. promotion of women, maintenance plans, institutionalized contacts to enterprises, tracer studies of graduates) should be introduced resp. recommended to other Technical Institutes.
12. To facilitate internships in companies for as many students as possible, the periods reserved for this should be more flexible, i.e. to create time slots outside the summer holidays for a continuous period of collecting practical experience.

**Promotion of Takoradi Technical Institute
Running period 1997 – 2005
Indicators: Target State vs. As-Is-State
at end of the project**

Objective: The trainees of TTI acquire vocational skills and qualifications which correspond to the changing demands of the labour market.

Prime objective: Improved, labour-market relevant technical and vocational skills and increased possibilities for creating income are available.

Cross-sectoral themes

Alleviation of poverty	Gender	Environmental conservation	Good governance	Public-Private Partnership
The project alleviated poverty indirectly: if a good qualification is available for poor people, it helps at job-seeking.	The TTI's vocational and advanced trainings are intended to fit to the special requirements of female apprentices and employees.	Not the project's topic and not relevant either.	Not the project's topic and not relevant either.	Not the project's topic and not relevant either.

Indicator 1	Indicator 2
Existence of an effective financial controlling system for the short courses until the end of 2002.	Existence and realization of a maintenance plan until the end of 2002.
Controlling system was introduced late, but it worked in 2005	Plan existed, although its realization was difficult.

Indicator 3	Indicator 4
Services increased from 59 in 2000 to at least 180 in 2004.	Establishment of a cooperation with at least 50 companies until the end of 2003.
In the last year of the project, 118 orders were registered	At the end of the project, there was a cooperation with ca. 100 companies

Indicator 5	Indicator 6
All newly developed vocational training programmes are accredited by Trade Advisory Committees by the end of the project phase.	At least three special short courses for women per year are organized and performed until 2003.
"Trade Advisory Boards" did not come about	Special short courses for women did not come about.

Indicator 7	Indicator 8
The participation rate of female apprentices in the TTI's full time training increases from 3,7% in 2000 to at least 10% in 2005. *	Three models of the TTI (e.g., short courses, services) are adopted and realized from at least four other vocational training institutions.
This participation rate was achieved and maintained until 2010	Varying approaches were tried out in some institutions

Indicator 9	Indicator 10
Formal workshops of the TTI, other vocational training institutions and employees of the department of vocational education of the Ghana Education Service take place quarterly.	A symposium with involvement of the head office of the Ghana Education Service and the stakeholders in vocational education takes place at the latest in 2004.
Took place on a regular basis at the end of the project	Took place in October of 2004 as a national conference

Indicator 1	Indicator 2
Existence of an effective financial controlling system for the short courses until the end of 2002.	Existence and realization of a maintenance plan until the end of 2002.
Controlling system was introduced late, but it worked in 2005	Plan existed, although its realization was difficult.

Indicator 3	Indicator 4
Services increased from 59 in 2000 to at least 180 in 2004.	Establishment of a cooperation with at least 50 companies until the end of 2003.
In the last year of the project, 118 orders were registered	At the end of the project, there was a cooperation with ca. 100 companies

Indicator 5	Indicator 6
All newly developed vocational training programmes are accredited by Trade Advisory Committees by the end of the project phase.	At least three special short courses for women per year are organized and performed until 2003.
"Trade Advisory Boards" did not come about	Special short courses for women did not come about.

Reference date:
June 30, 2005

* The project's aimed participation rate was 20 %, the indicator was laid down at 10 % by the evaluation team.



Indicator implemented

Partly implemented

Not implemented

KNOWING WHAT WORKS
KNOWING WHAT WORKS

Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5
65760 Eschborn/Germany
T +49 61 96 79-1408
F +49 61 96 79-801115
E evaluierung@giz.de
I www.giz.de