



PROFESSIONAL  
VOCATIONAL  
FORMATION

BERUFLICHE BILDUNG

FORMACIÓN PROFESIONAL  
FORMATION PROFESSIONAL  
BILDUNG  
IONAL TRAINING

## Final evaluation 2010 – Brief Report

Cooperation project: Rehabilitation and Modernisation of Vocational Training in the Province of Aceh and on the Island of Nias (North Sumatra), Indonesia

**Published by:**

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH (former GTZ)  
Evaluation Unit  
Postfach 5180  
65726 Eschborn  
T +49 61 96 79-1408  
F +49 61 96 79-801408  
E [evaluierung@giz.de](mailto:evaluierung@giz.de)

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH (former DED)  
Evaluation Unit  
Tulpenfeld 7  
53113 Bonn  
T +49 228 24 34-0  
F +49 228 24 34-111  
E [info@giz.de](mailto:info@giz.de)

Prepared on behalf of:  
Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development

Internet:  
[www.giz.de](http://www.giz.de)

Produced by:  
Dr. Eckart Koch, Dr. Hizir Sofyan  
AGEG Consultants eG

This report was produced by independent external experts.  
It reflects only their opinion and assessment.

Kirchheim unter Teck, 04.03.2011

## Tabular overview

### The evaluation mission

Evaluation period	May to October 2010
Evaluating institute / consulting firm	AGEG Consultants eG, Kirchheim unter Teck
Evaluation team	Prof. Dr. Eckart Koch (international) Dr. Hizir Sofyan (national)

### The development measure of GTZ

Title according to the offer	Cooperation Project: GTZ: Rehabilitation and Modernisation of Vocational Training in the Province of Aceh and on the Island of Nias (North Sumatra), Indonesia DED: Development measure Nr. 1 IDN-1 Programm Tsunami Rehabilitation and Reconstruction Aid Aceh
Number	PN 2005.2085.8
Overall term broken down by phases	07/2005 to 06/2010 <i>Notice:</i> The initially intended distribution in two phases (07/2005 to 06/2007 and 07/2007 to 06/2009) was cancelled with the acceptance of the modification offer in 2006. The project finally ended in 06/2010, whereas activities were severely reduced starting by the end of 2009.
Total costs	GTZ: 9,384,500 Euro (according to the last offer from 09/2009: 9,587,000 Euro) KfW: 22,000,000 Euro Partner contribution cannot be quantified
Overall objective as per the offer, for ongoing development measures also the objective for the current phase	The formal and non-formal vocational training and education system for students, trainees and for unemployed as well as underemployed men and women in Aceh Province and on the island of Nias is modernised to meet the needs of the national and local labour market.
Lead executing agency	Ministry of National Education (MoNE)
Implementing organisations (in the	Department of Education of Provincial Government of

partner country)	Aceh
Other participating development organisations	KfW, InWEnt, CIM
Target groups as per the offer	<p>Lower secondary school-leavers, other young male and female adolescents and adults with low qualifications for earning income and finding employment as well as former Gerakan Aceh Merdeka (GAM) combatants and their dependants.</p> <p>Intermediaries are the management and teachers of the assisted vocational secondary schools, the providers of non-formal vocational qualifications, and the government departments of vocational education and training at province and district level.</p>

### The development measure of DED

Title of the DED development measure	Special Programm Tsunami Rehabilitation Aceh
Number of the DED development measure	Development project No. 1 IDN-1 (DED-IDN-WB-VTC 1.1, Nos. 6421, 6422)
Overall term	07/2005 to 06/2009
Total costs	approx. 150,000 Euro
Overall objective of the DED development measure(s) as per country / regional director's report	Male and female adolescents and adult students of vocational training institutions in the Province of Aceh and on the island of Nias are qualified in accordance with the needs of the labour market.
Lead executing agency (in cooperative projects/programmes with the GTZ, see above)	Ministry of National Education (MoNE)
Partner organisation	Vocational Training Centre Banda Aceh
Other participating development organisations	GTZ, InWEnt, CIM
Target groups as per appraisal report / volunteer report	<p>Management of Vocational Training Centres</p> <p>Students of Vocational Training Centres</p> <p>Department of Education of Provincial Government of Aceh</p>

**The rating**

Overall rating	2 (good)
Individual rating	Relevance: 1 (very good); Effectiveness:2 (good); Impact: 2 (good); Efficiency: 3 (satisfactory); Sustainability: 3 (satisfactory)

The independent joint **final evaluation** of the cooperation project "Rehabilitation and Modernisation of Vocational Training in the Province of Aceh and on the Island of Nias (North Sumatra), Indonesia" and the DED-Development Project No.1 IDN-1 "Special Program Tsunami Rehabilitation Aceh", was carried out by AGEG Consultants eG, Kirchheim/Teck, from June to October 2010. The evaluation team consisted of Prof. Dr. Eckart Koch and Dr. Hizir Sofyan. The team analysed relevant documents, carried out interviews with representatives of various institutions at national, regional and district levels and visited project sites in Aceh und Nias. A comprehensive general interview guideline, a format for compiling relevant data, and a detailed questionnaire for focus groups - teachers and administrative staff at school level - served as tools for data collection and analysis.

The cooperation project between the Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (KfW) and the German Technical Cooperation (GTZ) started in July 2005 as part of a **rehabilitation program** after the devastating tsunami of 26 December 2004 that destroyed vast coastal areas in northern Indonesia and killed 230,000 people. A direct result of the natural disaster was the ending of almost thirty years of conflict between the Free Aceh Movement (GAM) and the Indonesian military. Thus it was expected that the project could provide a contribution to the peacekeeping process too.

The **lead executing agency** was the Ministry of National Education in Jakarta, while the department of education of the provincial government of Aceh was to ensure planning, steering and control of the various contributions. This was to be carried out through a panel in which the educational authorities of the districts, the Bureau of Rehabilitation and Reconstruction (BRR) and the cooperation project were represented. However, practically the BRR acted as main implementing partner until April 2009. For 39 months in total, between April 2006 and December 2008, the project was supported by two professionals of DED who were directly attached to the project. Furthermore, the project cooperated closely with CIM and InWEnt until it was terminated in June 2010.

The **results chain** was based on the modified offer of 2006. It relates to the GTZ project, but was supported by DED. It is consistent, however, results hypotheses were lacking so that a full fledged results chain did not exist. For this final evaluation, the impact chain was revised in a few points. The project objective was "to modernise the formal and non-formal vocational training and education system for students, trainees and for unemployed as well as underemployed men and women in Aceh Province and on the island of Nias according to the needs of the national and local labour market", in order to provide a contribution to reducing poverty as well as security problems in Aceh (indirect impacts). This objective could only be achieved together with KfW, which, according to the common agreement, was responsible

for the reconstruction of the school buildings and the provision of technical equipment for the schools.

Important **project outputs** were: the provision of school development plans and outlines for cooperation with enterprises and livelihood programs; job creation for women; the provision of further education programs for non-formal trainings institutions, the informal sector and former GAM fighters and their families as well as further education for teachers and management staff of the vocational schools and the department of education; and finally, a concept for a university postgraduate degree course for vocational teachers in Banda Aceh. The outputs were used by implementing the school development plans, attending training courses, adapting educational contents to the requirements of the labour market and offering revised courses for the informal sector, and finally, through an increased number of cooperation activities between schools and the business sector.

The **implementation** of the project was affected by the aftermath of the military conflict, difficult political and administrative processes and a consistently tense political situation in the project area. Further difficulties arose from the necessity to transform funds quickly into rehabilitation measures, meaning that greater consideration to sustainability aspects could only be given after the initial phase was over. Despite these limitations, the project was able to manage the professional implementation of the project concept in a flexible way, so that the greater part of the project outputs could be delivered, and the use of outputs usually took place. Thus the project objective has been achieved for the most part; however, it was limited due to the fact that capable non-formal training providers in Aceh could hardly be found.

**Capacity Development (CD):** Basically, the project, in cooperation with partners and intermediaries, organised generally successful training measures, which were carried out by Indonesian, Malaysian or German training providers. It was expected that these activities, in connection with the new hardware - essentially the rebuilt schools and production units, provided by KfW - would generate the expected developmental effects in Aceh. The increased competencies of the teachers and school headmasters contributed to an increased capability of the respective vocational schools and the strengthening of the vocational school system as a whole. The further training measures had positive effects, however, especially for technical teachers, additional follow-up training courses would have been appropriate.

Over 80% of all participants of further training measures observed positive effects within their respective schools, e.g. improved didactic competencies of the teachers and improved management skills of the headmasters. Given the usual natural fluctuation, promotions or postings of staff, it can be confirmed that capacity development at school level occurred. The same applies to the non-formal capacity development for Ex-GAM (Gerakan Aceh Merdeka)

fighters, which led to income generating occupations for 70% of those who attended the training courses.

The overall project measures are assessed below (now omitted) according to the five OECD -DAC criteria:

**Relevance:** The project was in line with all the essential plans and projects of the Indonesian Government as well as with German development concepts. It also contributed directly to the reconstruction of capacities for education, which had been urgently needed, and contributed to poverty reduction. Three-to-six-month school internships and the expansion of school based production units promoted the cooperation of schools with private enterprises. Vocational schools with a wider and upgraded range of services benefited from a substantial increase in applications. Major problems still exist in the labour market structure, which can only absorb a small number of graduates from higher vocational schools (SMK), and in the inadequate provision of budget for operation and maintenance (O&M) activities for technical equipment from the district authorities in charge. Moreover, the short project period prevented effects and impacts, which are usually achieved by projects with a much longer duration. In the beginning, the attention of the partner institution at national level was limited; it only improved with the official appreciation and the promotion of vocational schools by the Indonesian Government. This change was also supported by the new SMKs in Aceh, which gave a clear signal in that direction. The project had neutral to positive impacts on gender aspects; it benefited both males and females to the same extent. It had also clearly positive effects in terms of improving conflict sensibility and stabilising the framework conditions. All in all, the relevance criteria achieved a **very good result [level 1]**.

**Effectiveness:** Indicator 1: "An estimated 60% of the formal vocational education and training institutions provide occupational and market-oriented training services" was only achieved with regard to the formal educational institutions, but not by the non-formal ones. Thus, the schools do offer but very few short-term courses for the general public. Existing non-formal education providers, such as private institutions, special training institutes of ministries or suppliers at provincial or municipal level, like various "Centres for Learning Activities", were not properly promoted. Indicator 2: "5 pilot projects for employment-oriented, non-formal qualification measures were carried out" was reached in that 5 training measures, such as courses for members of a cocoa cooperative, led to increases in incomes. Indicator 3: "50% of graduates of non-formal training courses confirm that those professional and social skills that are required in the informal sector were imparted" and indicator 4: "at least 50% of the graduates find an adequate job" were achieved without restrictions. The main positive side effect was a considerably improved image of vocational schools, which resulted



in a strong, approx. 50%, increase in numbers of applicants within three years. Accordingly, the effectiveness reached a **good result [stage 2]**.

**Overarching development results (Impact):** Mainly through non-formal education measures for approx. 20% of 4,000 Ex-GAM fighters, the project positively contributed to poverty reduction and reducing security problems. However, there were only very few follow-up activities, and networking between former participants and an institutionalisation of such education measures did not take place. Rehabilitation and promotion of vocational schools led to a growth of both numbers of students as well as employment opportunities for graduates. Within three years both figures increased by around 50%, so that about 600 additional graduates per year were able to find employment. In addition, there were approx. 700 non-formal education beneficiaries. The project aided the school authorities in improving their strategic planning capacities and in the realisation of the objectives of the national education policy, which aims at reducing poverty through better education. The supported schools are now regarded as good examples or models, although they still do not generate enough of their own income and do not receive sufficient financial support from the district authorities. All in all, the impact achieved a **good result [stage 2]**.

**Efficiency:** Structure and approach of the measure were in principle appropriate: While co-operation with other projects in Aceh took place only exceptionally, the project cooperated closely with KfW (in the framework of the institutional cooperation) and other German development organisations. The DED professionals were integrated into the GTZ project. They supported the project, facilitated communication with local partners and contractors, and accelerated the implementation of measures so that a quantitative and qualitative contribution to achieve the project outcome was made. The high number of personnel was probably justified due to the special framework conditions of the rehabilitation measure, although it reduces its efficiency. A general benefit of the training measures was to create favourable conditions for more income generating activities. Over a ten-year period, an increase in revenues of around 40 mio. Euros can be assumed; this has to be seen in view of overall costs of roughly 33 mio. Euros. Additional qualitative effects have to be considered as well, such as better social and economic participation of people through employment, additional indirect growth effects from building a better skilled workforce pool and a contribution to gender equality. Overall, the efficiency has reached a **satisfactory result [Stage 3]**.

**Sustainability** considerations and the corresponding guiding principles (*Leitbild*) were given only limited scope due to the rehabilitation situation and the limited project period. The schools have ownership of the project's outputs, but usually, necessary strategic

consequences are still lacking. In contrast to the provincial government, which provides additional budgets for SMK, that attitude of responsibility is still comparatively underdeveloped in district authorities. *Risk factors* for a longer-term sustainability are therefore the limited funds schools can dispose of and the lacking awareness that further training for teachers and management staff has to be institutionalised. An ongoing market-oriented strategic adjustment of capacities and educational concepts through the SMK is still needed as well. For non-formal education, sustainability can only be expected if an institutionalisation through appropriate education providers is provided, which was not part of the project strategy. Given the uncertainties in formal education and the critical aspects with regard to the non-formal component, sustainability can only be rated as **satisfactory [level 3]**.

Overall, the project was successful and reached a **good result [stage 2]**.

**Recommendations:** In future the *German development cooperation* should try to pay more attention to the necessity that results chains, including results hypotheses, clearly reflect the project logic. Baseline data should be collected at a very early stage, a transparent and consistent results-based monitoring system and a clear exit strategy should be available as early as possible. A cost-benefit analysis would support project planning and evaluation. The different natures of necessary rapid reconstruction and sustainable development measures and the transition between these two stages should be clearly reflected in the project outline, so that both phases could be evaluated according to different criteria. Cash in- and outflows should be handled more flexibly and be adjusted to the changing absorption capacity of such projects. In future, FZ/TZ-cooperation projects in the field of vocational education, especially in the case of rehabilitation projects, will require a still more improved method of coordination between both projects, so that activities and outputs can be adjusted to changing framework conditions and unforeseen events more easily. Thus, for instance during the initial construction and procurement phase, the use of professional expertise of TZ experts is useful; however, trainings and further education for teachers and managers should be postponed until they can directly apply their new skills by using the new "hardware".

The *German development cooperation* and its *partner organisations* should continue supporting fast non-formal needs- and employment-oriented training measures. From the beginning, however, sustainability aspects should be taken care of and efforts should be made to professionalise training providers and to institutionalise such training programs. Further training for formal institutions, for teachers and headmasters, should also be institutionalised in the form of basic and advanced courses and provided regularly. The measures should consider all relevant administrative levels in order to reach ownership at all

levels and create a constructive and strategic understanding of the approach. Finally, such development approaches should include a component which, in a systematic way, improves the balance between education and the employment system.

**Comparison of target and actual situation with respect to achievement of the objective, on the basis of the indicators laid out in the contract (or the subsequently modified indicators) in an overview diagram, including the status of BMZ markers**

**GTZ: Cooperation Project: Rehabilitation and Modernisation of Vocational Training in the Province of Aceh and on the Island of Nias (North Sumatra) PN 2005.2085.8**  
**DED: Development Measure Nr. 1 IDN-1: Special Programm Tsunami Rehabilitation Aceh**

<b>Overall target:</b> „The formal and non-formal vocational training and education system for students, trainees and for unemployed as well as underemployed men and women in Aceh Province and on the island of Nias is modernised to meet the needs of the national and local labour market.“
<b>Impact</b> Poverty reduction and contribution to reducing security problems in Aceh.
<b>Outcome</b> The formal and non-formal vocational training and education system for students, trainees and for unemployed as well as underemployed men and women in Aceh Province and on the island of Nias is modernised to meet the needs of the national and local labour market.

<i>Cross-cutting Issues</i>		
Socio-economic impacts, contribution to Poverty Reduction (MSA)	Contribution to Gender Equality (G1)	Crisis Prevention, Conflict Transformation and Peace Promotion (K1)
The improved qualification of adolescents and adults for the needs of the labour market will lead to income increases and subsequently to an improvement of their living conditions. This applies in particular to the people affected by the tsunami and afterwards impoverished.	It is expected that there is sustainable improvement of the employability of girls and women within the Islamic society, which contributes to Gender Equality.	The measure is in line with Crisis Prevention, Conflict Transformation and Peace Promotion.
<b>Successful immediate participation of poor population groups via non-formal vocational training.</b>	In formal vocational training, the promotion of both males and females was the same. However, there were no specific measures in order to encourage women and girls.	<b>Contribution to stabilisation of the post-crisis situation via non-formal vocational training, from which also former GAM fighters and/or people affected by the tsunami or civil war will benefit.</b>

<b>Indicator 1:</b> An estimated 60% of the formal vocational education and training institutions provide occupational and market-oriented training services.
---

<b>Indicator 2:</b> 5 pilot projects for employment-oriented, non-formal qualification measures, which concentrate on the needs of the jobholders in the informal sector - especially women, former GAM fighters and their families - were carried out.
---

<b>Indicator 3:</b> 50% of graduates of non-formal training courses confirm that those professional and social skills that are required in the informal sector were imparted.
---

<b>Indicator 4:</b> At least 50% of the graduates find an adequate job.
---

<b>Indicator 5:</b> At least 10 % increase of household incomes of the graduates of the formal education and training institutions as well as of the livelihood programmes.
---

<b>Indicator 6:</b> The overall security situation has increased.
---

Green – achieved Amber – partly achieved Red – not achieved Blue – not evaluated

KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH  
(former GTZ)  
Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5  
65760 Eschborn/ Germany  
T +49 61 96 79-1408  
F +49 61 96 79-801115  
E [evaluierung@giz.de](mailto:evaluierung@giz.de)  
I [www.giz.de](http://www.giz.de)

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH  
(former DED)  
Tulpenfeld 7  
53113 Bonn/ Germany  
T +49 228 24 34-0  
F +49 228 24 34-111  
E [info@giz.de](mailto:info@giz.de)