



## Interim evaluation 2010 – Brief Report

Employment Promotion Programme - EPP, Sierra Leone

**Published by:**

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH  
Evaluation Unit  
Postfach 5180  
65726 Eschborn  
T +49 61 96 79-1408  
F +49 61 96 79-801408  
E [evaluierung@giz.de](mailto:evaluierung@giz.de)

Prepared on behalf of:  
Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development

Internet:  
[www.giz.de](http://www.giz.de)

Produced by:  
Independent consultants:  
Dr. Hildegard Schürings, Germany  
Mr. Sahr Sorrie, Sierra Leone

This report was produced by independent external experts.  
It reflects only their opinion and assessment.

Frankfurt, Freetown - May 2011

## Tabular overview

### The evaluation mission

Evaluation period	01.07.-31.12.2010
Evaluating institute / consulting firm	Independent consultants
Evaluation team	Mrs. Hildegard Schürings Mr. Sahr Sorrie

### The development measure

Title according to the offer	Employment promotion for marginalised youth, Sierra Leone
Number	1. Phase: 2004.2217.0 2. Phase: 2009.2292.2
Overall term broken down by phases	1. Phase: 01.01.2006 – 31.03.2010 2. Phase: 01.04.2010 - 31.03.2013
Total costs	1. Phase: EUR 3,600.000, Modification offer 2006: 7,600,000, Modification offer 4.08.2008: EUR 11,600,000 2. Phase: Offer 2009: EUR 10,800,000 (of which EUR 7,000,000 are new commitments and EUR 3,800,000 are remaining funds) + from 6/2010: EUR 1,200,000 NFE-Component Total Costs: 17.200.000 EUR
Overall objective as per the offer, for ongoing development measures also the objective for the current phase	1) Employment opportunities including demand-oriented training for young people are developed, framework conditions for restoring the production and marketing capacities of the private sector are improved, and income-creating activities are initiated in accordance with the requirements of the PRSP (Pillar II: promoting pro-poor sustainable economic growth for food security and jobs creation). 2) The employment and income situation of young people in rural areas has improved.

Lead executing agency	<p>1) Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, then, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, then Ministry of Employment and Labour.</p> <p>2) Ministry of Employment and Social Security - Directorate for Planning and Employment Promotion.</p>
Implementing organisations (in the partner country)	<p>1) Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, Ministry of Local Government and Community Development</p> <p>2) Ministries of Agriculture, Trade, Decentralisation and the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, National Commission on Social Action (NaSCA)</p> <p>The administrative authorities of the selected districts, representatives of the formal private sector like Sierra Leonean Indigenous Business Association–SLIBA.</p>
Other participating development organisations	<p>1) German Federal Agency for Technical Relief – THW, Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau – KfW, World Bank, United Nations Development Programme - UNDP</p> <p>2) Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau - KfW, Deutsche Welthungerhilfe – WHH, International Labour Organisation, - ILO, Food and Agricultural Organisation - FAO, UNDP</p>
Target groups as per the offer	<p>1) - Marginalised youth of both genders aged 15 to 35 and selected groups at community level in rural and urban areas committed to income-creating activities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Owners and workers of small and medium-size enterprises, enterprises in the informal economy and large companies with a high employment potential.</li> </ul> <p>2) - Both young men and women (15-35 years old) who are unemployed or are working in informal, underpaid and/or temporary employment situations (underemployment).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Smallholder producers and owners and workers of small, medium-size and large enterprises with a high employment potential that earn their income from processing/ marketing agricultural products and providing inputs for rural business sectors (link to rural value chains).</li> </ul>

**The rating**

Overall rating  <i>On a scale of 1 (very good, significantly better than expected) to 6 (the project/program is useless, or the situation has deteriorated on balance)</i>	2
Individual rating	Relevance: 1; Effectiveness: 2; Impact: 2; Efficiency: 3; Sustainability: 3

*“The National Vision has provided an exciting opportunity for individual Sierra Leoneans to contribute their ideas and talent to the process of peace and reconciliation. Through the National Vision, Sierra Leoneans of all ages and backgrounds may claim their own citizenship space in the new Sierra Leone and make their contributions to the country's cultural and national heritage. Most of all, the contributions show what Sierra Leone can be. They show the enormous potential that exists. In the words of one contributor, Wurie Mamadu Tamba Barrie: “The inspiration is let's sprint, if we can't sprint, let's run, if we can't run, let's walk, if we also can't walk, then let's crawl, but in any way possible, let's keep on moving”.* Special Court for Sierra Leone: Overview of the Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, October 2004: 10.

The independent interim evaluation of the Employment Promotion Programme in Sierra Leone has been commissioned by the former German Technical Cooperation (GTZ). It was executed by the international consultant, Mrs. Hildegard Schürings, specialised in employment promotion, education and vocational training, peace promotion and gender, together with Mr. Sahr Sorrie, national expert for education, training, cultural and socio-political heritage of Sierra Leone. The field mission was realised from 9<sup>th</sup> October to 1<sup>st</sup> November 2010 with extensive travelling to five districts. An inception report was elaborated prior to the field mission by the international consultant. As the programme is highly complex, several weeks were invested in preparing the mission. Based on a broad review of about 300 documents, the consultants interviewed about 250 actors and organisations, involved in the programme at different stages.

The cornerstone of German Development Cooperation with Sierra Leone is private sector development and employment promotion. For the first phase, the overall objective of the programme which started in 2006 is: *“Employment opportunities including demand-oriented training for young people are developed, framework conditions for restoring the production and marketing capacities of the private sector are improved, and income-creating activities are initiated in accordance with the requirements of the Poverty Reduction Strategy of Sierra Leone.”* The second phase is executed from April 2010 till March 2013. The objective responds to the first peace-building needs in the country, as identified by the Government of Sierra Leone and the United Nations Peace Building Commission.

The target groups are marginalised youth of both genders aged 15 to 35 years, selected groups at community level in rural and urban areas committed to income-creating activities, and owners and workers of micro, small and medium-size enterprises, and large companies with a high employment potential. Until now, the Sierra Leonean society suffers from the legacy of an 11 years lasting civil war (1991-2002), during which the social fabric was deeply affected. Most infrastructures like schools, roads, production and market mechanisms, especially in the eastern part of the country, were destroyed. Many people fled to other

Interim Evaluation – Employment Promotion Programme - EPP, Sierra Leone – 2010

regions and lived, during years, under ignoble conditions. Atrocities affected all citizens, especially children, youth and women, frequently harassed by sexually based violence. The main cause of the war was the marginalisation of the youth, their exclusion from education, access to and control over resources and decision making. Sierra Leone has, since the ending of the war, made remarkable progress in restoring the economic sector, rebuilding the society, establishing democratic rules, respecting human rights and freedom of expression, promoting education, and improving the health sector. The country benefits from enormous international support.

The first phase of the programme had two quite distinguished sub-phases with different approaches, different partners and project personnel. In the beginning, the Sierra Leonean main political partner was the Ministry of Education, Sciences and Technology. Due to a conceptual shift to more private sector development, the main partner is now the Ministry of Employment and Social Security. Other implementing partners are line ministries, parastatals, district and traditional authorities, business associations and enterprises, rural communities and non-governmental organisations. The programme is cooperating with several international agencies like the United Nations Development Programme. The focus of this evaluation was supposed to be “Technical and Vocational Education and Training”. However, by assessing the development measure it became obvious that the programme shifted in its beginning more to Private Sector Development. With the aim to contribute to the rehabilitation of the economy, the programme supported several micro, small and medium-size enterprises, associations as well as a national employment survey. In cooperation with the German Federal Agency for Technical Relief (THW), various trainings were offered to young people. These experiences were channelled onto the macro level by advice for the development of policies and strategies for Youth Employment and Private Sector Development.

A conceptual and organisational restructuring process of the programme began in 2008, which is still on-going. The programme continues to support associations and Public-Private-Partnerships. In cooperation with a Pro-Poor Growth for Peace Consolidation Programme, financed by the Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau German Development Bank - (KfW) and Sierra Leonean partners, the participatory planning of rehabilitation of infrastructure contributes to the decentralisation process and the empowerment of people. Since 2009, the Voluntary Youth Resettlement & Reintegration Project is part of the programme. In cooperation with the German Deutsche Welthungerhilfe organic and fair trade cocoa farming are supported since 2010. A non-formal education project, promoting the qualification of

young people and preparing for entrepreneurship, is an integral part of the programme since June 2010. The programme is acting on local, regional and national level.

This evaluation is based on the GTZ results model, and the report follows the “Guidelines on evaluating the success of projects/ programmes”. The assessment by the five OECD-DAC development criteria (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development – Development Assistance Committee) shows that the programme is a learning organisation with high potential to adapt its approaches to changing conditions to assure its objectives being met. Concerning the programme’s relevance the assessment of national and international policies, strategies and experiences in war-torn societies and of the needs of the target groups, mostly young people and communities suffering from the war, indicates that the programme is highly relevant. Private sector development and employment promotion for youth is important for development, as seen from the priorities of the Sierra Leonean Government, the United Nations, the Millennium Development Goals, development partners and Germany. The matching of skills and entrepreneurship development with private sector development is highly appropriate. The collaboration of German Financial and Technical Cooperation reinforces the creation of basic conditions for development like infrastructure in rural areas. The interventions on three levels, micro, meso and macro are contributing to support communities and to channel these experiences into policy development. Therefore the **relevance of the programme is rated very good (1)**.

The restructuring process of the programme was a big step towards more coordinated interventions by different components and actors. The four indicators measuring effectiveness are nearly achieved: a comprehensive national employment survey was used by the Government and donor agencies. All supported sub-projects were assessed in 2008/ 2009 by the programme. Due to mainly inappropriate implementation, not all sub-projects were successful in creating jobs. Others measures like the resettlement component, cocoa farming and four Private Public Partnerships contributed to enhance the livelihood of several thousand people. Vocational Training for different target groups contributed to create new job opportunities. The results exceeded the set indicator on the training part, but not for employment. Today’s most performing business association in the country is responsible for the improvement of capacities of several micro, small and medium-size enterprises and associations. Although only few data are gender aggregated, it is estimated that about 30% girls and women benefited from the interventions. The **effectiveness is rated good (2)**.

Concerning the overarching development results (impact), new approaches have been adopted like various modes of skills development, value chain development, and the resettlement approach. The application of the value chain tool in rural areas is an integrated

approach to pro-poor-growth development. Whether this approach will lead to the expected results within selected districts is yet not proved. Technical Vocational Education and Training contributes to empower young people. Some sub-projects seem to have a positive impact on longer term, especially cocoa-farming and the reintegration of families by increasing the income of farmers. An important challenge for gender equality is that the currently supported value chains are mainly addressing men. The programme is contributing to more food security and by this contributes to stabilise the situation and to diminish the conflicts in the communities. Poverty reduction and gender equality will not be reached by 2015, but the measure fosters to achieve the Millennium Development Goal 1: *Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger* and goal 3: *Promote gender equality* by creation of employment opportunities for both genders. It is contributing to the prevention of further crisis by peace and conflict monitoring. The overall **rating of impact is 2 (good)**.

Efficiency has been improved during the whole first and second phase. In the first sub-phase important funds were allocated for supporting small and medium-size enterprises and associations, then - with the broadening of support in several areas - much more financing was allocated to technical advice, capacity development on all levels and reintegration of families. Since its beginning the programme is characterised by a high instability of international staff, which affects the efficiency of the output. An asset is the national staff with large experience in GTZ-supported programmes and influencing the quality of the output. The programme managed the resources efficiently. But a lack of follow-up of measures in the first sub-phase and mismanagement of funds affected the efficiency. Due to unavailable data, it is not possible to evaluate cost-effectiveness of most of the measures but for the resettlement component it is very good. The structure as a programme is appropriate to the conditions in Sierra Leone and allows to develop new instruments and to mobilise external resources in collaboration with implementing partners. The focussing on some districts has positive effects on the output. Collaboration of national, German and development partners has improved during the second sub-phase but should be enhanced especially on harmonisation of approaches, common evaluations and better use of available funds. **The efficiency is rated 3 (satisfactory)**.

Sustainability depends on the international and national framework conditions. The political will of the Government is evident and proved by the improvement of framework conditions (business climate, policies, peace consolidation, and decentralisation). The elections in 2012 are an important challenge, as there is a risk that experienced personnel in government bodies will be replaced, as in 2007, and this will affect sustainability. The Government and the programme need to broaden the spectrum of relevant stakeholders. Supporting the

ongoing decentralisation process is positive. A clear strategy for private sector development indicating how to reach ecological sustainability, poverty reduction, gender equality and improvement of the ownership of development could enhance sustainability. More job opportunities are important to create a future for young people and to prevent social unrest. More sharing of lessons learnt with others, creating synergies and the identification of replicable cases in all areas would enhance the probability of sustainability. In its ongoing second phase, the programme is consolidating; it continues to contribute to the empowerment and improvement of the livelihood of young people. Given the 'state of implementation' at the time of the evaluation the program's implementation will have to be accelerated to reach its objectives until 2013. **The sustainability is rated 3 (satisfactory).**

The overall rating for the programme is good (2).

The most important recommendations are directed to the German Development Cooperation, for the *first phase of the program (January 2006 – March 2010)*:

- *Identify lessons learnt, success factors, replicable cases* within supported sub-projects and share it with national and development partners

*Outlook for the current phase (April 2010-March 2013):*

- Develop a clear *Private Sector Development Strategy* related to agro-business, land-grabbing, ecological sustainability and out-grower schemes with Private Public Partnerships, supporting the rights of the poor
- Conduct *base-line studies* on living conditions, job opportunities, gender
- Organise *impact studies*, e.g. the impact on *youth and job creation, on peace and conflicts issues*, and coordinate with national and international partners
- Elaborate *a sector specific gender equality strategy*
- Establish a common *quantitative and qualitative results oriented and conflict-sensitive monitoring system* for all components of the programme
- *Reinforce the building of a congruent programme and create more synergy* between all stakeholders
- *Assure transparency and accountability* and enhance *communication at all levels*
- Resolve *pending cases* like mismanagement of funds.

Recommendations addressing the Government of Sierra Leone and implementing partners:

- *Enhance the collaboration between government bodies, development partners, representatives of the private sector and civil society*
- *Reinforce local ownership of population and self-sustainability by regular auto-evaluations of the effects on youth, training and employment, impacts on the communities and participation in development and decision making.*

<b>Outcome : Overall objective</b> (direct results):	<b>Employment opportunities including demand-oriented training for young people are developed, Framework conditions for restoring the production and marketing capacities of the private sector are improved, and income-creating activities are initiated in accordance with the requirements of the PRSP</b>		
<b>Cross cutting issues:</b>	<b>GG 1</b> No gender strategy, but gender friendly, need of a gender strategy for PSD, TVET, value chains, resettlement evaluate IGD.	<b>HIV/AIDS</b> Good collaboration with NGOs with good results, should be continued	<b>KR 1</b> Very good PCA-Analysis, PCA monitoring is done, but recommendations not sufficiently implemented, should be regularly done for all interventions
	<b>AO- SUA</b> is contributing, should be enhanced	<b>PD 1</b> is contributing, collaborate with more social partners	<b>UR 0</b> is contributing to positive effects on biodiversity and organic farming
<b>Indicators per Offer 2006, updated 9/2010 after review of available data</b>			
<b>Indicator 1:</b> Starting from 1/2008, the National Employment Survey is used as one of the foundations for a national employment strategy (enquiries among ministries and other donors).	The National Employment Survey was conducted in 2007 und is used since 2008 by several government bodies (MOESS, MEYS -YES-programme) and donor agencies (ADB, ILO, UNDP, World Bank) to develop a national youth employment strategy (currently not finished) and MOESS presented in 2008 the Survey to the President's Advisors with the aim to create a Youth Commission for Employment. In preparation for the Consultative Group Meetings (November 2009) GTZ, UNDP and MOESS, MEYS prepared a workshop for the development of the National Youth Employment Strategy (Source: interviews, Schlussbericht 8.2010)		
<b>Indicator 2:</b> Until 3/ 2010, the number of new, sustainable jobs in selected small and large enterprises and in selected rural grassroots communities amounts to 3900, including 30 % for women (enquiries among the enterprises promoted), (Offer 2008, integration of a FSR component: 6.900).	Till June 2008, 37 projects in urban and rural areas were supported, in 2008/2009 assessed and some closed, others continued to get advice and financial support. 4 PPP were realised (386 permanent jobs and 200 seasonal). In total, with TWH-Training, VYRR (818 jobs) and WHH-Stabex (1000) and by support of SLIBA about 6.128 self-employment possibilities were created or enhanced, some are seasonal jobs, others upgraded or an increase of income (estimated 30% females), in total 89%. SLIBA realised a job creation programme with the support of EPP, but does not create itself (see indicator 4). It is supposed that 1000 jobs were created by its interventions. Most of the jobs created may not be sustainable. There is a doubt if these figures are realistic. More rigorous evaluations are needed. (Sources: interviews, observation, Schlussbericht 8.2010, EPP-report job creation 12.2010)		
<b>Indicator 3:</b> Until 12/ 2008, 300 young people in Freetown and in three districts are trained in line with needs as a contribution to fulfilling indicators of the PRSP (Pillar II) and the national Youth Employment Scheme, and 75 % of those	By four different types of training with technology options, in total 656 persons have been trained. The number of female depends on the training course; it ranges from 0-5% in the 10 month training to 83% in the three weeks training (water/ sanitation is a women issue). Achievement for technology trainings: 219 % (656 instead of 300). But for job creation, there is doubt about the figures (557, EPP-report, 12.2010), the employment rate seems to be high for GTA-Training (85%), but mostly		

<p>completing the course (including 30 % women) find a permanent job (Tracer Study six months after completion of the training programmes).</p>	<p>low for the other trainings (0-44%) and permanent jobs are very rare. Other short trainings on business development were realised by SLIBA (670, 45% female). More rigorous tracer studies are necessary to investigate the after-training conditions. (Source: calculation by consultant on different documents, Interviews TWH, GTA, SSGI, THW Tracer Study 2008, EPP-Schlussbericht 8/2010, EPP-report job creation 12.2010)</p>
<p><b>Indicator 4:</b> Until 3/ 2010, the capability of the SME and NGO associations revived since the end of the war to represent and advise their members in line with the requirements of the national Private Sector Development Strategy and to support them in tapping sources of financing rises from the current level of no cases resolved (15 cases currently pending) to at least ten successfully and independently resolved cases per year (survey) = 40</p>	<p>Since 2007, the rehabilitation of SLIBA, the most important MSME-association with currently 500 members was widely supported and receives continuing advice in business development. SLIBA offers good BDS and training to members and associations. EPP support it for networking with other organisations (YEN meeting Dakar, Ghana Trade Fair). SLIBA is member of the National Committee for Employment, Coalition for Business Associations, National Coordinating Committee on Trade and Financial Reform Group. It gets support by several donors and it advised about 100 SME, and 65 SME or associations got a credit at local banks. SLIEPA - Sierra Leonean Investment and Export Promotion Agency - got support to participate with 7 enterprises at the German European Trade Fair &amp; Exhibition in Ghana 2009. Achievement 160%. (Source: interview SLIBA, EPP- Schlussbericht 8.2010)</p>

Indicator achieved

Indicator partly achieved

**BMZ-DAC Markers, Offer 2006:**

**Anticipated socio-economic impacts:** The project is oriented to direct poverty reduction. By developing sustainable employment opportunities for young people the prerequisites will be created for integrating them into economic and social cycles. The project makes a major contribution to reducing extreme poverty in urban centres and in rural areas. With regard to the poverty orientation the project is therefore allocated to category SUA.

**Anticipated socio-cultural impacts:** The participatory development and strengthening of democratic grass roots structures such as associations and other structures in civil society is a primary objective of the project. *Good governance* is promoted by introducing innovative forms of cooperation between the private and public sector. The project is allocated to category **PD 1**.

The project **benefits young women systematically** as they are strongly involved in activities in the key sectors supported (agriculture and micro enterprises in urban areas). Frequently, in rural regions the groups promoted consist exclusively or mainly of women. Furthermore, the project tackles female genital mutilation in an innovative fashion (linking employment promotion with combating of this practice). Gender equality is an important secondary objective so the project is allocated to category **G-1**.

**Anticipated conflict-reducing and/or peace-promoting impacts:** Disadvantaged young people are considered to be a risk group. The conceptual approach of the project promotes their economic and social integration. It is expected that this integration will reduce conflicts and promote peace. The monitoring system of the project is designed to be sensitive to crises. The project is therefore allocated to category **KR-1**.

**Anticipated ecological impacts:** One component of the project consists in waste disposal for the city of Freetown. In addition the target groups are guided towards responsible handling of natural resources. No other direct ecological impacts are to be expected from the project. It is allocated to category **UR-0**.

**Offer 2009:** PG (Participatory development/Good governance): 1, UR (Environmental protection and resource conservation): 0, GG (Gender equality): 1, TD (Trade development/Aid for Trade): 0, DES (Combating desertification): 0, BIO (Biodiversity): 0, KR (Crisis classification): 1, AO (Poverty orientation): SUA, PBA (Programme-based approach) relevance: 0.

KNOWING WHAT WORKS  
KNOWING WHAT WORKS

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5  
65760 Eschborn/Germany  
T +49 61 96 79-1408  
F +49 61 96 79-801115  
E [evaluierung@giz.de](mailto:evaluierung@giz.de)  
I [www.giz.de](http://www.giz.de)